

Table of Contents

Introduction

<i>(Marion Weschka)</i>	1
-------------------------------	---

A. General research aspects3

I. Problems with terminology and definitions <i>(Michael Bader)</i>	5
II. Etymological background and further clarifying remarks concerning chimeras and hybrids <i>(Josef Kuře)</i>	7
1. Introduction	7
2. Semantic analysis.....	7
a. Chimera as an archetype	7
b. Etymological background.....	10
c. Chimera as a metaphor and as a terminus technicus.....	11
d. Hybrid.....	12
e. Some further differentiations	14
f. Chimera as a strategy	15
3. Anthropological clarifications	16
a. Chimera and the deeper understanding of humanity.....	16
b. Should we cross boundaries?.....	18
c. The art of slowness	19
III. Scientific background <i>(Michael Bader, Regine Schreiner, Eckhard Wolf)</i>	21
1. Introduction	21
2. Intra-species mixtures	24
a. Intra-species chimeras.....	24
b. Intra-species hybrids.....	28
3. Inter-species mixtures	28
a. Inter-species chimeras.....	28
b. Inter-species hybrids.....	32

VIII Table of Contents

c. Examples of inter-species mixtures	
aa. Xenotransplantation (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	35
bb. Transgenic animals carrying human genes (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	39
cc. Nuclear transfer research (<i>Andras Dinnyes, Marion Weschka, Qi Zhou</i>)	43
dd. Transplantation of human embryonic stem cells into animal brain (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	51
ee. Hamster test: Testing human sperm capacity with hamster ova (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	52
ff. Mixing of embryos (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	53
gg. Interspecies gestation (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	54
hh. Other mixtures (Matrixes)	55
- Remarks to the matrix „Chimeras and Hybrids” (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	55
- Matrix Chimeras and Hybrids: Human-Animal mixtures (Chimbrids).....	57
- Encompassing Matrix	59
IV. Ethics (<i>Autumn Fiester, Marcus Düwell</i>)	61
1. Introduction.....	61
2. The Fundamental Debates on Moral Status: What Makes Entities Morally Significant?.....	62
a. Preliminary Remarks	62
b. Moral Status Based on Sentience (i.e., on the ability to feel pain or suffer)	63
c. Moral Status Based on Agency, Self-Consciousness or Rationality	64
d. Moral Status Based on the Significance of the Human Species ..	65
e. Moral Status Based on the Intrinsic Value of Animals.....	66
aa. Applications of Moral Status: Potentiality, Precaution and Symbolic Extensions of Status	67

bb. Applications of Moral Status: Potentiality.....	67
cc. Applications of Moral Status: Precaution	68
dd. Applications of Moral Status: Symbolic Meanings	68
f. The Moral Status of Human Embryos and Chimbrids.....	70
3. Specific Moral Considerations in Evaluating Chimbrids: An Ethical Matrix.....	70
a. Preliminary Remarks	71
b. Moral Considerations in Research Ethics	71
c. Moral Considerations in Animal Ethics.....	73
V. Law	79
1. Legal tools and strategies for the regulation of chimbrids (<i>Elisabeth Rynning</i>).....	79
a. Introduction	79
b. Determining the aims of the regulatory project	80
c. Identifying the appropriate regulator	81
d. The choice of regulatory instruments	81
e. Decision-making in individual cases	84
f. Monitoring and sanctions	84
g. Some challenges in the regulation of chimbrids.....	85
2. Which Beings Should Be Entitled to Human Rights? (<i>Erwin Bernat</i>)	88
a. The General Concept of Personhood	88
b. Human Rights – Their Meaning and Their Foundation.....	89
c. Human Rights and the Constitution.....	91
aa. The Paradigm: Born of a Human (the Natural Person)	91
bb. Does the Unborn Human Being Enjoy Constitutionally Protected Human Rights?	92
cc. Indicators of Personhood	94
d. The Status of Chimeras and Chimeric Embryos.....	95
3. Chimbrids and International Law (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	98

X Table of Contents

4. EU Law and Council of Europe Law applicable to chimera and hybrid research (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	116
a. Relevant facts.....	116
b. Research law.....	116
c. Protection of human-beings by the fundamental rights of the European Union.....	119
d. Protection of human rights and the dignity of the human being within the Council of Europe's Legal Framework.....	119
e. Protection of biotechnological inventions.....	121
f. Protection of personal data.....	122
g. Protection of Health.....	123
h. Protection of animals in the case of animal experiments.....	129
i. Genetics in the non-human domain.....	131
5. National law.....	132
a. EU member states.....	132
aa. Austria (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	132
bb. France (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	136
cc. Germany (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	140
dd. Sweden (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	145
ee. Spain (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	150
ff. United Kingdom (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	151
b. Other Countries.....	158
aa. Switzerland (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	158
bb. Israel (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	165
cc. United States (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	169

dd. Canada (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	173
ee. China (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	178
ff. Japan (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	180
B. Key Cases in chimbrids research.....	185
I. Case 1 – Muotri: Transfer of human embryonic stem cell–derived neurons in mouse brain.....	187
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	187
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Autumn Fiester</i>)	190
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Deryck Beyleveld</i>)	196
II. Case 2 – Chen: Interspecies somatic cell nuclear transfer	201
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	201
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	205
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	209
III. Case 3 – Bailey: Animal-Human Xenotransplantation.....	231
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	231
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	235
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	237
IV. Case 4 – Fink: Porcine Xenografts in Parkinson’s Disease and Huntington’s Disease patients	263
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	263
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	267

XII Table of Contents

3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Jan C. Joerden</i>)	271
V. Case 5 – McCune: The SCID-hu Mouse	287
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	287
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Autumn Fiester</i>).....	290
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Sonia Desmoulin</i>).....	293
VI. Case 6 – EMEA: Transgenic goat producing human antithrombin	317
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	317
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Dominik Groß</i>)	320
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>)	324
VII. Case 7 – O’Doherty: Mouse with human chromosome	353
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	353
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Dominik Groß</i>)	356
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>)	360
VIII. Case 8 – Yanagimachi: Hamster egg penetration test.....	361
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	361
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	364
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	367
IX. Case 9 – Fehilly: Human-animal embryo mixing.....	379
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	379
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Dominik Groß</i>)	381

3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Marion Weschka</i>)	385
X. Case 10 – Nan et al.: Interspecies gestation.....	405
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	405
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Josef Kuře</i>)	407
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	410
XI. Short Remarks to the cases 1-10 in the light of European legal order (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>)	427
C. Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations.....	433
I. General remarks	435
II. Scientific overview of human-animal mixtures	437
III. Ethical Aspects	441
1. Moral status	441
2. Human research ethics	443
3. Animal ethics.....	444
4. Appearance and Symbolic Meaning	445
5. Plurality of ethical theories and legal regulations	446
IV. Legal Aspects	449
1. The regulatory needs and challenges	449
2. Regulatory tools and strategies applied	450
3. Concluding remarks	452
V. Recommendations	455
Annex.....	459
Annex A. Chimbrids – Scientific, Ethical and Legal reports.....	461
I. Science	463
1. Transgenic animals carrying human genes: Methods and Ethical Aspects (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	463

XIV Table of Contents

2. Xenotransplantation – Aspects of Chimerism (Regine Schreiner, Regina Klose, Eckhard Wolf).....	475
3. Nuclear Transfer, Chimeras and Hybrids: Activities and legal Aspects of Research in Hungary (Andras Dinnyes).....	501
4. Interspecies Nuclear Transfer Research in China (Qi Zhou).....	524
5. Developing Human-Nonhuman Chimeras in Human Stem Cell Research: Ethical Issues and Boundaries (Philip Karpowicz, Cynthia B. Cohen, Derek van der Kooy).....	535
6. Chimeras in developmental biology: scientific objectives and ethical issues (Béatrice de Montera, Isabelle Hue, Jean-Paul Renard).....	556
II. Ethics	571
1. Man-made chimeras, hybrids and mosaics – ethical perspectives (Gisela Badura-Lotter, Marcus Düwell)	571
2. Ethical Issues in Transgenesis: Biopharming, Xenotransplantation & Recreational Transgenesis (Autumn Fiester).....	592
III. Law	603
1. Theses concerning chimerisation and hybridisation from an ethical and legal perspective (Jan C. Joerden, Cornelia Winter)	603
2. The Regulation of Hybrids and Chimeras in the UK (Deryck Beyleveld, Tom Finnegan, Shaun D. Pattinson).....	645
3. Providing a legal framework for chimeras - French Report (Sonia Desmoulin).....	667
4. Legal Aspects of Human-Animal Chimeras and Hybrids: Country Report Sweden (Elisabeth Rynning).....	689
5. Chimeras and Other Human-Animal Mixtures in Relation to the Swiss Constitution and Swiss Laws: A Case for Regulatory Action (Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard).	706
6. Die rechtliche Regelung von Chimären und Hybridwesen – ein österreichischer Landesbericht (Erwin Bernat).....	716
7. New types of chimeras and hybrids: a challenge for biolaw (Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain)	734

8. The legislation on chimeras and hybrids in Spain (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	741
9. Discussing the European Union Competences to Legislate on Chimbrids Research (<i>Filip Krepelka</i>)	743
10. Legal Issues involving Hybrids and Chimeras: United States Country Report (<i>Timothy Stoltzfus Jost</i>)	754
11. Legal Aspects of Human-Animal Combinations in Canada (<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>)	778
12. Legal and Ethical Aspects of Chimera and Hybrid Research in Israel: Country Report with Comparative Observations (<i>Amos Shapira</i>)	798
13. Bioethical Discussions on Specified Embryos in Japan (<i>Motomu Shimoda</i>)	809
14. The Law Concerning Regulations Relating to Human Cloning Techniques, Handling of a Specified Embryo and Animal Experiment in Japan (<i>Fumio Tokotani</i>)	817
15. Human embryonic stem cell research in China (<i>Dai Kuisheng</i>)	819
Annex B. Country Reports on the 10 Cases	827
I. Germany: Case 1-10 according to German Law (<i>Jan C. Joerden, Marion Weschka</i>)	829
1. Case 1 – Muotri Case	829
2. Case 2 – Chen Case (interspecies SCNT human into rabbit)	833
3. Case 3 – Animal-Human Xenotransplantation	835
4. Case 4 – Fink	837
5. Case 5 – McCune	838
6. Case 6 – EMEA	841
7. Case 7 – O’Doherty	842
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster test	843
9. Case 9 – Mixing of embryos	844
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	844

XVI Table of Contents

II. UK: Case 1-10 according to UK law (<i>Deryck Beyleveld</i>)	847
1. Muotri Case	847
2. Chen Case	848
3. Bailey Case. Baboon to Human Cardiac Xenotransplant in Neonates.....	849
4. Fink Case Porcine Xenografts for Huntington's	850
5. McCune Case: SCID.....	850
6. Transgenic Goat Case	851
7. Mice with Down's Syndrome Phenotypes.....	851
8. Golden Hamster Test	851
9. Mixing of Embryos.....	852
10. Interspecies Gestation	852
III. France Legal Issues in French Law: the case studies (<i>Sonia Desmoulin</i>)	855
1. Case 1 – Muotri	855
2. Case 2 – Chen	860
3. Case 3 – Chen (alternative).....	863
4. Case 4 – Fink	867
5. Case 5 – McCune	868
6. Case 6 – EMEA	872
7. Case 7 – O'Doherty	875
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster test.....	876
9. Case 9 – Mixing of Embryos	878
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	880
IV. Sweden – Case 1-10 according to Swedish law (<i>Elisabeth Rynning</i>)	883
1. Case 1 – Muotri, A.R. et al. (2005).....	883
2. Case 2 – Chen, Y. et al. (2003).....	884
3. Case 3 – Bailey Leonard L. et al. (1985)	886
4. Case 4 – Fink, J.S. et al. (2000)	887
5. Case 5 – McCune et al. (1988).....	888

6. Case 6 – EMEA	890
7. Case 7 – O’Doherty, A. et al. (2005)	890
8. Case 8 – Hoo Lee M. et al. (2007).....	891
9. Case 9 – Mixing of embryos.....	892
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	894
V. Spain – Case 1-10 according to Spanish law (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	897
1. Case 1	897
2. Case 2	898
3. Case 3	901
4. Case 4	903
5. Case 5	905
6. Case 6	908
7. Case 7	909
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster test.....	912
9. Case 9 – Mixing of embryos.....	912
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	914
VI. Austria – Case 1-10 according to Austrian Law (<i>Erwin Bernat</i>).....	917
1. Case 1 – Muotri case.....	917
2. Case 2 – Chen case	917
3. Case 3 – Bailey case	918
4. Case 4 – Fink case	918
5. Case 5 – McCune case.....	919
6. Case 6 – Transgenic goat case	919
7. Case 7 – O’Doherty case	919
8. Case 8 – Hoo Lee case.....	920
9. Case 9 – Fehilly case	920
10. Case 10 – Nan case	921
VII. Switzerland Case 1 to 10 according to Swiss Law (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	923
1. Case 1 - Muotri	923

XVIII Table of Contents

2. Case 2 - Chen.....	931
3. Case 3 - Bailey.....	933
4. Case 4 - Fink.....	937
5. Case 5 - McCune.....	939
6. Case 6 - EMEA.....	940
7. Case 7 - O'Doherty.....	945
8. Case 8 - Yanagimachi.....	947
9. Case 9 - Fehilly.....	947
10. Case 10 - Nan et al.....	951
11. Alternative to Case 10 - Zavos and Illmensee.....	951
VIII. USA – Case comments	
(<i>Timothy Stoltzfus Jost</i>).....	955
1. Case 1: Human embryonic stem cells into brain of mouse embryo/ foetus at day 14.....	955
2. Case 2, Chen, Y. et al. (2003): Embryonic stem cells generated by nuclear transfer of human somatic nuclei into rabbit oocytes.....	958
3. Case 3: Solid organ xenotransplantation of xenograft into human being.....	959
4. Case 4: Porcine xenografts (porcine foetal neuronal cells) in Parkinson's Disease and Huntington's Disease Patients.....	963
5. Case 5: Human foetal cells into adult mice.....	966
6. Case 6: Transgenic goats that secrete human antithrombin into their milk; transfer of human DNA into goat zygotes.....	968
7. Case 7: Aneuploid mouse strain carrying human chromosome 21 with Down's syndrome phenotypes; transfer of almost full human chromosome 21 into mouse embryonic stem cells; afterwards injection into mouse blastocysts.....	970
8. Case 8: Golden Hamster Test.....	971
9. Case 9: Mixing embryos of non-human species with embryos of human species.....	972
10. Case 10: Interspecies Gestation.....	975
IX. Canada	
(<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>).....	977
A. Introduction.....	977

1. Case Study No. 1	983
2. Case Study No. 2	991
3. Case Study No. 3	994
4. Case Study No. 4	1002
5. Case Study No. 5	1003
6. Case Study No. 6	1006
7. Case Study No. 7	1008
8. Case Study No. 8	1010
9. Case Study No. 9	1013
10. Case Study No. 10	1016
X. Israel – Case 1-10 according to Israeli law (<i>Amos Shapira</i>)	1019
1. Case 1 – Muotri	1019
2. Case 2 – Chen	1019
3. Case 3 – Chen (alternative)	1020
4. Case 4 – Fink	1021
5. Case 5 – McCune	1022
6. Case 6 – EMEA	1023
7. Case 7 – O'Doherty	1023
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster Test	1024
9. Case 9 – Mixing of Embryos	1025
10. Case 10 – Interspecies Gestation: Transfer of an Animal Embryo into the Uterus of a Woman and Transfer of a Human Embryo into the Uterus of an Animal.	1026
XI. Japan – Case 1-10 according to Japanese Law (<i>Fumio Tokotani</i>)	1029
Table of Authors.....	1031
Index.....	1037

CHIMBRIDS - Chimeras and Hybrids in Comparative
European and International Research
Scientific, Ethical, Philosophical and Legal Aspects
Taupitz, J.; Weschka, M. (Eds.)
2009, XIX, 1039 p., Softcover
ISBN: 978-3-540-93868-2