

# Contents

- 1 The “Ethics Job”** ..... 1
  - 1.1 The Role of the “In-house” Ethicist and How This Book  
Came About ..... 1
  - 1.2 Research in Genomics ..... 3
    - 1.2.1 Genetics and Genomics ..... 3
    - 1.2.2 A Genomics Research Project: The Procardis Consortium .... 4
    - 1.2.3 Varieties of Genomics Research ..... 4
  - 1.3 Ethical Debate in Genomics ..... 5
  - 1.4 Putting Philosophy to Work in Ethics and Genomics ..... 7
    - 1.4.1 Careful Attention to Steps in Arguments ..... 7
    - 1.4.2 Matching up Theory with Experience ..... 8
    - 1.4.3 Developing Moral Thought ..... 10
  - 1.5 Conclusions ..... 12
  - 1.6 Study Questions ..... 13
  - 1.7 Coming Up Next ..... 13
  - References ..... 13
- 2 Why Research Ethics? Why Ethics in Genetics? The Case  
of Genomics Research** ..... 15
  - 2.1 A Brief History of the Ethical Regulation of Research ..... 15
  - 2.2 An Equally Brief History of Ethical Issues in Genetics ..... 18
    - 2.2.1 Worries About Eugenics ..... 18
    - 2.2.2 Genetics and Populations: The Spectre of “Race” ..... 21
    - 2.2.3 Genetics and Reproduction ..... 22
    - 2.2.4 Genetics, Life, and Identity ..... 22
  - 2.3 Meet ELSI ..... 24
  - 2.4 Too Much Ethics? ..... 26
  - 2.5 Human Subjects and Subjects of Research ..... 28
  - 2.6 Lessons from Research Abuses and Open Debate ..... 32
  - 2.7 Researchers Facing Ethical Issues: Accounts from  
the Front Line ..... 33

2.7.1 Researchers Behaving Well: Detective Work Amongst the Mormons .....	34
2.7.2 Researchers Behaving Well: Warning the NIH About Privacy Risks .....	37
2.7.3 Researchers Behaving Well: What Watson Didn't Want to Know .....	38
2.8 Epilogue: What Can We Learn from Good Behaviour? .....	39
2.9 Conclusions .....	39
2.10 Study Questions .....	40
2.11 Coming Up Next .....	40
References .....	40
 <b>3 What Ethics Is, What It Is Not, and How We Are Going to Proceed .....</b>	<b>43</b>
3.1 What Ethics Is Not: Clearing Away Confusion .....	43
3.1.1 The Business of Research Ethics Committees .....	43
3.1.2 ELSI and Ethics .....	47
3.1.3 Ethics Aims to Improve Standards ....? .....	48
3.1.4 A Note About the Practical Goals of Ethics .....	50
3.2 What Ethics Is .....	50
3.2.1 Universal Ethics or Relativistic Ethics? .....	52
3.2.2 Thinking Right and Doing Right: Moral Motivation .....	53
3.2.3 What Can We Hope for in Ethics? .....	53
3.2.4 Ethics and Other Values: The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Scientific Progress .....	54
3.2.5 The Case of the "Missing Ethics" .....	56
3.2.6 Reasoning in Ethics: A Very Brief Summary .....	57
3.2.7 Empirical Work in Ethics .....	60
3.3 Conclusions .....	61
3.4 Study Questions .....	61
3.5 Coming Up Next .....	62
References .....	62
 <b>4 Starting Analysis in Ethics: A Practical Guide .....</b>	<b>65</b>
4.1 Introduction: How to Use This Chapter .....	65
4.2 Critical Reading in Ethics: Some Strategies .....	66
4.3 Reading an Article on Ethics: Some Preliminaries .....	67
4.3.1 What Journal? .....	68
4.3.2 The Range of Work in Ethics .....	68
4.3.3 Authors and Authority .....	69
4.3.4 Authors' Disciplinary Backgrounds and Affiliations .....	69
4.4 Some Basic Questions to Ask as You Are Reading .....	70
4.4.1 Where in the Text Can You Find Arguments and Evidence for Positions? .....	70

4.4.2 Key Concepts and Terms Used .....	71
4.4.3 What Words Are Used? Same Phenomenon, Different Descriptions, Different Values .....	72
4.4.4 What Conclusions, If Any, Are Drawn? .....	73
4.5 Looking for Assumptions: Presenting Positions and Framing Texts .....	74
4.5.1 Common Framings in Genetics and Genomics: Speed and “Future Promise” .....	77
4.6 Conclusions .....	79
4.7 Study Questions .....	79
4.8 Coming Up Next .....	81
References .....	81
<b>5 An Overview of Research Ethics and Challenges from Genomics ...</b>	<b>83</b>
5.1 Introduction: Some Challenges in Genomics Research .....	83
5.1.1 The Traditional Basis of Research Ethics and Genomics Research .....	84
5.1.2 Potential Harms of Genomics Research: Informational Harms .....	84
5.1.3 Research Networks .....	86
5.2 Ethical Issues .....	88
5.2.1 Informed Consent: Complexity of Information and Rapid Change .....	88
5.2.2 Informed Consent: Individuals, Families, and Populations ..	90
5.2.3 Withdrawal from Research: Difficult, but then, Is It Really Necessary in Genomics? .....	91
5.2.4 Confidentiality and Privacy in Genomics Research: New Challenges to the Power to Protect Data .....	92
5.2.5 Confidentiality and Privacy in Genomics Research: Whose Confidentiality, Whose Privacy? .....	93
5.2.6 Feedback of Findings in Genomics Research .....	93
5.2.7 Benefit Sharing in Genomics Research .....	94
5.2.8 Genomics Research, Ancestry and Race .....	95
5.2.9 Can Genomics Information Be Inherently “Bad”? .....	97
5.2.10 Public Health Genomics .....	97
5.3 Ethical Issues in Social Science Research: Parallels and Lessons for Genomics Research .....	100
5.4 A Note on Technology and Ethics .....	101
5.5 Conclusions .....	103
5.6 Study Questions .....	104
5.7 Coming Up Next .....	105
References .....	106

<b>6</b>	<b>Autonomy and Its Limits: The View from Genomics</b>	109
6.1	Introduction	109
6.2	What Is Autonomy? Philosophical Accounts of the Notion of Autonomy	110
6.2.1	Descriptive and Normative Accounts of Autonomy	111
6.2.2	Mere Choice: Or Reasoned Choice?	111
6.2.3	Negative and Positive Approaches to Autonomy	112
6.2.4	The Domain of Autonomy: Self, Body, Life, Information	112
6.2.5	Autonomy, Community, and Other Values	115
6.2.6	Alternative Ways of Valuing and Protecting the Individual Not Based on Autonomy	117
6.3	Autonomy in Research Ethics: Research Upon Autonomy	118
6.3.1	Milgram's Obedience Experiments	119
6.3.2	Moral Conceit: What We Do Not Know About Ourselves	120
6.3.3	The Fragility of Autonomy	121
6.3.4	Consent, Authority, and Institutions	122
6.3.5	Consent, Conscience, and Persuasion	123
6.3.6	The Institutionalisation of Consent	125
6.4	Conclusions	127
6.5	Study Questions	127
6.6	Coming Up Next	128
	References	129
<b>7</b>	<b>The Social and Institutional Setting of Ethics</b>	131
7.1	Introduction	131
7.2	Science in a Social Context	132
7.2.1	Science and Money	132
7.2.2	Scientific Teamwork	135
7.2.3	Science and Wider Society	135
7.3	Institutional Influences and Authority	136
7.4	Social Influences on Moral Action	139
7.4.1	Institutional Ethics: Administrative Evil	140
7.5	Hindrances to Ethical Action and Reasoning and What to Do About Them	141
7.5.1	Time	141
7.5.2	Dehumanisation	144
7.5.3	Social Conformity	145
7.5.4	Moral Disengagement	146
7.5.5	The Diffusion of Responsibility	146
7.5.6	Whistleblowers	147
7.6	Conclusions	147
7.7	Study Questions	148
7.8	Coming Up Next	148
	References	149

<b>8</b>	<b>Respect for Persons in Research and in Genetics</b>	151
8.1	Study Question	151
8.2	Introduction	152
8.3	Varieties of Respect: Divergent Understandings of the Concept of Respect for Persons	153
8.4	Background: The Debate About Feedback of Results	154
8.5	The Use and Misuse of the Notion of “Respect for Persons” in a Current Debate in Genomics Research Ethics	156
8.6	Concluding Unscientific Postscript: Problems with the Use of Science in Ethical Debate	164
8.7	The Need for Detailed Consideration of Different Cases	167
8.8	Conclusions	168
8.9	Study Questions	169
8.10	Coming Up Next	170
	Appendix: Participants at a Workshop on Respect for Persons, St. Hugh’s College Oxford, 2010	170
	References	172
<b>9</b>	<b>Responsibilities of Researchers in Genetics</b>	173
9.1	Introduction	173
9.2	Responsibility for Health	175
9.3	Responsibilities of the Medical Profession	177
9.4	Responsibilities of Medical Researchers	178
9.5	Recent Calls for Researchers in Genomics to Take on Expanding Responsibilities	180
9.6	The Nature of Responsibility: “Chains of Responsibility” in Research Networks?	182
9.7	Responsibilities of Research Subjects and Genomics Research	183
9.8	Legal Notions of Responsibility: The “Duty of Care” of Genomics Researchers	184
9.9	Moral Responsibility: Some Lessons from Psychology	187
9.9.1	Warnings for Genomics Research: Ways in Which We Abnegate Responsibility	187
9.9.2	Ideology and Responsibility	189
9.9.3	How Can Responsible Behaviour Be Fostered?	189
9.10	Conclusions	190
9.11	Study Questions	191
9.12	Coming Up Next	192
	References	192
<b>10</b>	<b>Data Sharing in Genomics</b>	195
10.1	Introduction	195
10.2	Reasons to Share Genomics Data: Views from Policy and Practice	198

10.2.1 Data Sharing as the Norm .....	198
10.2.2 Improving Scientific Outputs .....	199
10.2.3 Fostering Novelty and Scientific Creativity .....	199
10.2.4 The Value of Sharing Certain Sorts of Data .....	199
10.2.5 Visions of Scientific and of Human Progress .....	199
10.2.6 The Value of Data and the Value of Knowledge .....	200
10.2.7 Data Sharing and Good Scientific Practice .....	200
10.2.8 Good Data Sharing and Stewardship .....	200
10.2.9 Data Sharing and Research Participants .....	200
10.2.10 Data Sharing Brings Benefit to the Public .....	201
10.2.11 The Timing of Data Sharing, Speed and Brakes .....	201
10.2.12 Interests in Controlling Data .....	201
10.3 Data Sharing and Scientific Practice .....	203
10.3.1 Stewardship of Data .....	204
10.3.2 Rewards, Sanctions, and the Scientific Community .....	204
10.4 The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Sharing Knowledge .....	206
10.5 Reasons Not to Share: Privacy and the Control of Personal Information .....	209
10.6 Do We Own Our Genetic Information? .....	211
10.7 The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Sharing Knowledge: Summary and Analysis .....	213
10.8 Conclusions .....	214
10.9 Study Questions .....	214
References .....	215
<b>Afterword</b> .....	217
<b>Glossary</b> .....	219
<b>Abbreviations</b> .....	223
<b>Index of Text Boxes</b> .....	225
<b>Subject Index</b> .....	227

Ethical Challenges in Genomics Research  
A Guide to Understanding Ethics in Context

Boddington, P.

2012, XIV, 234 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-642-23698-3