

Contents

Part I Introduction

1	Reconsidering the Legal Concepts of Genocide and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’	3
1.1	Children as Targets of Genocide	3
1.2	Genocide as a Separate Category of Grave International Crime	9
1.3	Children as a ‘Protected Group’: Implications for Our Understanding of ‘Protected Group’	11
1.3.1	The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children and Children as a ‘Protected Group’	16
1.4	Additional Points Regarding ‘Protected Groups’	20
1.5	‘Restrictive Interpretation’ of Genocide Provisions: Implications for the Notion of Children as Persons	22
1.5.1	Restrictive Interpretation That Favours the Intention of the Parties Versus What Is Expressed in Text	24
1.6	Foreseeability, Perpetrator Accountability and Rome Statute Article 6(e)	28
1.6.1	The Nullum Crimen Principle and the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children to an Armed Group or Force	30
1.6.2	Evolving Conceptions of What Constitutes a Protected Group	34
1.7	The Rome Statute Article 6 Protected Group “As Such” Terminology	37
1.7.1	‘Forcible Displacement’ vs. ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’	38
1.7.2	Genocide’s Special Targets and the Destruction of Future Generations	41
	Literature, Materials and Situations/Cases	47

Part II ICC Prosecutor Case Selection and Charging Decisions

2 Gravity and Interests of Justice Considerations	53
2.1 Ambiguity of the Test for ‘Sufficient Gravity’ Regarding Admissibility of the Case	53
2.2 The Situation in the DRC: Case Selection and Gravity	55
2.3 The Situation in Darfur: Case Selection and Gravity	58
2.3.1 Parallels Between U.N. Peacekeepers and Children as ‘Protected Groups’	60
2.4 Legal Characterization of the Facts and the Assessment of Gravity	61
2.4.1 ‘Relative Gravity’ and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’	63
2.5 Children’s Right to Justice and Legal Empowerment	64
2.6 Truth and Reconciliation Mechanisms and Child Victims	67
2.7 An Additional Note Regarding Child Soldier Victims of the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’	69
2.8 Child Soldiers and the Question of Potential State Criminal Liability	74
2.9 ‘The Interests of Justice’ and ICC Case Admissibility	77
Literature, Materials and Situations/Cases	80

Part III Selected ICC Cases Illustrating the Failure to Address the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children

3 Case 1: Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo (Hereafter Also Referred to as <i>Lubanga</i>)	85
3.1 The War Crimes Charges: On Why They Were Insufficient	85
3.1.1 The Confirmed Charges	85
3.1.2 The Prosecution’s Closing: Selected Issues Arising	86
3.1.3 The Context of Armed Conflict in <i>Lubanga</i>	94
3.1.4 The Common Plan and Genocidal Intent	97
3.1.5 Gender Crimes and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’	106
3.1.6 The Legal Re-Characterization of the Facts Controversy in <i>Lubanga</i>	113
3.1.7 On the Short Training Afforded FPLC Child Soldiers: Implications	137
3.1.8 The ‘Continuous Nature’ of the International Crimes Perpetrated Against FPLC Child Soldiers	138
3.1.9 The Defence Closing and the Prosecution Reply: Selected Issues Arising	146
Literature, Materials and Cases	197

4 Case 2: Prosecutor v. Germain Katanga and Mathieu Ngudjolo Chui	201
4.1 Confirmed Charges	201
4.2 The Prosecution Opening Statement	202
4.3 Charging Sexual Violence Crimes Under the Rome Statute	203
4.4 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children as “Child Soldiers”	208
4.4.1 The FNI/FRPI Appropriation of Children as the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’	208
4.4.2 Cruel and Inhuman Treatment of FNI/FRPI ‘Child Soldiers’	214
4.4.3 Mens Rea and the Appropriation of Children to the FNI/FRPI	217
4.4.4 Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children; Nationality and the Protected Status of Children	218
4.4.5 More on Outrages on Personal Dignity	219
Literature, Materials and Cases	220
5 Case 3: Prosecutor v Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir	223
5.1 Background	223
5.2 The Prosecutor’s ICC Application for an Arrest Warrant Re Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir (14 July, 2008)	224
5.2.1 On Whether Darfur Involved ‘Autogenocide’ and Whether Correctly Answering that Question Matters	224
5.2.2 Motive, Genocide and Child Soldiering	225
5.2.3 The Targeting of So-Called ‘Arab’ Children of Darfur for Child Soldiering as an Act of Genocide	228
5.2.4 Sexual Violence as a Vehicle for the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children	232
5.2.5 The Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers by the GoS During the Time Period Covered by the Al Bashir Case (March 2003 to July 14, 2008)	236
5.2.6 Report of the Secretary-General on Children and Armed Conflict in the Sudan (5 July, 2011)	237
5.3 The Interests of Justice and a Judicial Remedy for Child Victims in Darfur	242
5.4 The Standard of Proof in Regards to Establishing the Offence of Genocide in Its Various Forms	244
5.4.1 The Struggle to Confirm Genocide Charges in the Al Bashir Case	244
5.5 The Standard of Proof in Regards to Establishing the Offence of the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children (Warrant Stage)	245
5.6 On Identifying Genocide in Darfur	248
5.7 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children in Darfur	253
Literature, Materials and Cases	257

Part IV Conclusion

6 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children: A Crime Well Established in International Law; Yet Still Not Prosecuted by the ICC	261
6.1 Introduction	261
6.2 Gravity of the Crime as an ICC Admissibility Criterion	268
6.3 The Interests of Justice: Insights from the ICC Pre-Trial Judgement in <i>Kenya</i>	269
6.4 The Somali Situation and the Matter of Impunity for Perpetrating ‘Child Soldiering’	270
6.4.1 Introduction	270
6.4.2 Background to the Somali Situation and Child Victimization	271
6.5 Gravity of the International Crimes Perpetrated by Al Shabaab Against Children	276
6.6 Pursuing the Accountability of Somali Perpetrators	278
6.7 The Situation in Chad and the Matter of Impunity for Perpetrating ‘Child Soldiering’	283
6.7.1 Reports by Amnesty International and the UN on the Situation in Chad	283
6.7.2 Chad and the U.S. ‘Child Soldiers Prevention Act of 2008’	287
6.8 Acknowledging Existing International Norms that Protect Children from Genocidal Forcible Transfer	289
6.8.1 Gaps in Children’s Access to International Justice	291
6.8.2 Genocidal Context and the Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers	293
6.8.3 Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children Through Sexual Victimization	298
6.8.4 ICC independence and Impartiality and Prosecuting Grave International Crimes Perpetrated Against Children	301
6.8.5 The ICC and the Interests of Child Victims of Genocidal Forcible Transfer	303
6.9 PostScript: The Syrian Regime’s Genocidal Targeting of Children in Particular	308
Literature, Materials and Cases	313
Index	317

Humanity's Children

ICC Jurisprudence and the Failure to Address the
Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children

Grover, S.C.

2013, XII, 324 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-642-32500-7