

Detailed table of contents

Acknowledgement	5
Overview of contents	7
Detailed table of contents	9
Figures	19
Tables	21
List of Abbreviations	23
1 Introduction	27
1.1 Motivation	27
1.2 Inductive-deductive research process	30
1.3 White Certificate Instruments	31
1.3.1 How do WCIs work?	32
1.3.2 Two sources of WCIs	34
1.3.3 Measurement of savings	36
1.3.4 Design Choices: Determining the WCI's mode of action	37
1.3.4.1 WCI as hybrid instruments: the quest for functional equivalents	38
1.3.4.2 Quantity versus price incentives	39
1.3.4.3 Coercion versus flexibility	40
1.3.4.4 Provision of information, enhancing networking and cooperation	41
1.3.5 Additionality	42

1.3.6	WCIs in practice – deriving the research question	42
2	Theoretical framework	49
2.1	Studying WCIs: A policy analysis perspective	49
2.2	Ideas in context – expanding Historical Institutionalism to Constructivist Institutionalism	52
2.2.1	Strategic action and goals	57
2.2.2	Fostering change: Framing the problem and creating a policy image	60
2.2.3	Policy entrepreneurs as agents of strategic action	63
2.2.4	Unintended outcomes and prevailing tensions	65
2.3	Policy instruments and change: tools, indicators, or agents?	66
2.3.1	Explaining policy instrument choice and change	66
2.3.2	Implications of a historical-constructivist institutionalism perspective for models explaining policy instrument choice	70
2.4	Understanding market-based policy instruments	77
2.4.1	MBIs as ‘technical tools’: a variety of categorizations	77
2.4.2	Strategies and misconceptions: Ideas about market and market-based policy instruments	83
2.4.3	WCI – a hybrid in disguise	87
2.5	Energy efficiency – The complexity challenge	90
2.5.1	Multiple goals	91
2.5.1.1	The liberalization of energy markets	92
2.5.1.2	Security of energy supply	93
2.5.1.3	Climate change	93
2.5.2	Multiple solutions	94
2.5.3	Multiple actors	96
3	Methodological Operationalization	101

3.1	Introduction: Two levels of analysis	101
3.2	Process tracing	104
3.2.1	Archival research	104
3.2.2	Semi-structured expert interviews	105
3.3	Perception tracing	106
3.3.1	Qualitative content analysis	107
3.3.1.1	General rules	108
3.3.1.2	Establishing search patterns	109
3.3.2	Participatory observation	111
3.4	Putting the pieces together: multidimensional comparison	111
4	Research on WCIs	115
4.1	Introduction: Analysing the WCI expert community	115
4.2	Identifying and selecting sources for analysis	116
4.3	Delineating and characterizing the expert community	117
4.4	2004–2007: European and international research projects	119
4.4.1	Research Consortia	120
4.4.2	Objectives and research focus	120
4.4.3	Results and design recommendations	122
4.4.4	The three research projects in a nutshell	127
4.5	Major Publications	128
4.5.1	Literature presenting the ‘big picture’	129
4.5.2	Literature on WCIs and trading	135
4.5.3	Comparing WCIs with other policy instruments	137
4.6	Knowledge development: Preliminary summary of written material	140
4.7	Conferences	142

4.7.1	IEA workshop on WCIs in Milan	143
4.7.2	JRC Workshop on ‘White certificates, utility and supplier obligation’ in Brussels	143
4.7.2.1	European harmonization versus national particularities	145
4.7.2.2	Flexibility versus coercion	146
4.7.2.3	WCI in the context of energy-efficiency discourses	148
4.7.3	ECEEE summer study 2009	151
4.7.3.1	Presentation on WCIs in Italy, Britain, and France	153
4.7.3.2	Informational session on recent news on WCIs	155
4.7.4	Exchanging knowledge at conferences: Summary	156
4.8	Concluding analysis	158
4.8.1	Focal issues over time	159
4.8.2	Preliminary conclusions	164
5	France	167
5.1	The French energy structure	167
5.1.1	Energy savings in the 2006 investment plans	169
5.1.2	Energy savings in the 2009 investment plans	170
5.1.3	Slowly liberalizing energy markets	171
5.2	History of White Certificate Instruments in France	172
5.2.1	Existing measures in end-use energy efficiency	173
5.2.2	First period Agenda-setting: Choosing a market-based policy instrument	175
5.2.2.1	Design choices: regulating the details	177
5.2.2.2	Outcomes	184
5.2.3	Second period	185
5.2.4	Preliminary conclusions on the history of WCI in France	188

5.3	The discourses of energy efficiency in France	189
5.3.1	Liberalization of energy markets – Protecting the incumbent and creating business opportunities	189
5.3.2	Energy efficiency in the discourse of the Grenelle de l’Environnement: Environmental and social objectives enter the stage	192
5.4	Perceptions on the WCI and the policy process – the policy image	194
5.4.1	Objective (and hidden) purposes	195
5.4.2	Mode of action and demarcation from other policy instruments	196
5.4.3	Design choices and political conflict	201
5.4.3.1	Negotiating primary legislation	201
5.4.3.2	Negotiating secondary legislation	205
5.5	Conclusion: The French WCI between market and regulatory practice	209
6	Britain	213
6.1	The British energy structure	213
6.2	History of White Certificate Instruments in Britain	216
6.2.1	First phase: Energy Efficiency Standards of Performance (EESoP) and the E Factor: preparing agenda-setting	218
6.2.2	Second phase: Energy Efficiency Commitment (EEC)	223
6.2.2.1	Agenda-setting	223
6.2.2.2	Design choices	225
6.2.2.3	Outcome	226
6.2.3	Third phase: Carbon Emission Reduction Target (CERT): Recasting the obligation	227
6.2.3.1	Agenda-setting	227

6.2.3.2	Design choices	228
6.2.4	Summary	232
6.3	Discourses of energy efficiency in Britain	233
6.3.1	The discourse of liberalizing energy markets and tackling fuel poverty	233
6.3.2	Energy efficiency in the climate change discourse	237
6.4	Perceptions of the WCI and the policy process – the policy image	245
6.4.1	Objective and (hidden) purposes	245
6.4.2	Mode of action distinct from other policy instruments	246
6.4.3	Design choices and political conflict	251
6.5	Conclusion: re-regulation and competition of objectives	258
7	Italy	263
7.1	The Italian energy structure	263
7.2	History of White Certificate Instruments in Italy	267
7.2.1	Existing policies and measures to increase energy efficiency in end-use sectors	267
7.2.2	First period	269
7.2.2.1	Agenda-setting	269
7.2.2.2	Design choices: creating a market	272
7.2.2.3	Updates in design	278
7.2.2.4	Outcome	281
7.2.3	Preliminary conclusions on the history of the WCI in Italy	290
7.3	Perception of the WCI and the policy process – the policy image	293
7.3.1	Objectives and (hidden) purposes	293
7.3.2	Mode of action and demarcation from other policy instruments	294

7.3.3	Design choices and political conflicts	300
7.4	Conclusion: cost-effective – to whom?	303
8	Comparison	309
8.1	Comparing the case studies	309
8.1.1	Objectives: Intended and delivered	310
8.1.1.1	Security of supply	310
8.1.1.2	Consumer protection in liberalized energy markets	311
8.1.1.3	Climate protection	312
8.1.1.4	Cost effectiveness	313
8.1.1.5	Delivered objectives	314
8.1.1.6	Competition of objectives, unintended effects and discourses of energy efficiency	316
8.1.2	Mode of action: flexibility versus coercion	318
8.1.2.1	The role of standardized measures	318
8.1.2.2	Scope of obliged and eligible actors	319
8.1.2.3	Trading	321
8.1.3	Incentive mechanisms (prices, obligation, cost recovery, penalties)	322
8.1.3.1	Perceived modes of action	323
8.1.3.2	Breaking with traditions?	325
8.1.4	The policy image in the interplay between actors and institutions	325
8.1.4.1	Policy entrepreneurs	326
8.1.4.2	Political parties and administration	327
8.1.4.3	Energy companies in their regulatory environment	329
8.1.4.4	Newly institutionalized structures	333

8.2	Comparison of research on WCI with practical insights	335
8.2.1	Emergence and consideration of knowledge	335
8.2.2	Framing a success story	337
8.2.3	Ideological reinforcement versus depoliticization	339
9	Conclusions	341
9.1	Theoretical lessons	341
9.1.1	Common design features of WCIs	342
9.1.2	Hybrid instruments: too smart to steer?	343
9.1.3	Hybrid instrument WCI – offering room for misconceptions	346
9.1.4	All-embracing hybrid instrument: framing a success story 'WCI'	349
9.1.5	Challenging the effectiveness of hybrid instruments	350
9.1.6	Summary: policy instrument choice and change remain a politicized process	352
9.2	For practitioners: Transposing theoretical lessons into practice	356
9.3	Future prospects	361
9.3.1	Discussion of methodological approach	361
9.3.2	Remaining research questions and current dynamics of WCI development	362
9.3.3	Coda: Vision 2050	365
	List of References	367
	Annex	391
	Annex I – List of Interviewees	391
	Annex II – List of Conferences and Workshops with Participatory Observation	392
	Annex III: Questionnaire template France	392
	Annex IV: Questionnaire template Italy	394

Annex V: Questionnaire template United Kingdom	395
Annex VI: Exemplary sheets used to document participatory observation	397
Analysis of a Panel Discussion on WCI with regard to policy instrument's mode of action	397
Annex VII: Counting experts to filter out core group of experts	403

Energy Efficiency Governance

The Case of White Certificate Instruments for Energy
Efficiency in Europe

Steuer, D.S.

2013, XXV, 382 p. 17 illus., Softcover

ISBN: 978-3-658-00680-8