

Content

Part I Adaptive Logics as a Framework for Defeasible Logics

1	Introduction	3
1.1	Defeasible Reasoning	3
1.2	Towards the Formalization of Defeasible Reasoning	6
	References	9
2	The Standard Format for Adaptive Logics	11
2.1	The Standard Format	11
2.2	The Lower Limit Logic	12
2.3	The Abnormalities	13
2.4	The Adaptive Strategy	14
2.4.1	The Reliability Strategy	15
2.4.2	The Minimal Abnormality Strategy	23
2.4.3	A Special Case: The Simple Strategy	29
2.5	Modeling Defeasibility in Adaptive Proofs	30
2.5.1	Internal and External Dynamics	30
2.5.2	Comparing the Strategies	33
2.5.3	Adaptive Logics and Plausible Reasoning	35
2.6	Some Properties of ALs in Standard Format	42
2.6.1	Properties of the Adaptive Consequence Relations	42
2.6.2	Some Remarks on Computational Complexity	46
2.6.3	Excursus on the Rational Properties	46
2.7	The Necessity of Superimposing Classical Connectives	50
2.8	Normal Selections: A ‘Credulous’ Strategy that is not in the Standard Format	53
	References	57
3	Sequential Combinations of ALs	59
3.1	The Consequence Relation of CAL	60
3.2	Semantics for Sequential ALs	65

3.2.1	Soundness and Completeness for Reliability.	68
3.2.2	Soundness and Completeness for Some Other Special Cases	70
3.3	A Proof Theory for CAL	73
3.3.1	The Proof Format	73
3.3.2	Preparing for the Marking Definitions	75
3.3.3	The <i>i</i> -Marking for the Reliability Strategy	76
3.3.4	The <i>i</i> -Marking for the Minimal Abnormality Strategy.	78
3.3.5	An Alternative to the inh-marking for Some Special Cases	81
3.4	Normal Selections.	82
3.5	Conclusion.	83
	References	84
4	On the Transparency of Defeasible Logics: Equivalent Premise Sets, Equivalence of Their Extensions, and Maximality of the Lower Limit	85
4.1	Formats for Logics for Defeasible Reasoning.	85
4.2	Equivalent Premise Sets	88
4.3	Equivalent Premise Sets and ALs	91
4.4	Characterizations Under a Translation	95
4.5	Extensions of Equivalent Premise Sets	96
4.6	Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic.	99
4.7	In Conclusion.	102
	References	103
5	Generalizing the Standard Format	107
5.1	Introduction	107
5.2	Some Examples	109
5.2.1	The Standard Format: Minimal Abnormality	110
5.2.2	Lexicographic ALs	111
5.2.3	Counting Abnormalities	113
5.2.4	A Most Skeptical Rationale: Reliability	114
5.2.5	Colexicographic ALs	116
5.2.6	The Problem of Non-Smoothness	117
5.2.7	More Refined Quantitative Examples	119
5.2.8	Summary	121
5.3	The Generic Adaptive Logic \mathbf{AL}_Λ	122
5.3.1	The Semantics	124
5.3.2	The Dynamic Proof Theory	124
5.4	Representational Results for \mathbf{AL}_Λ	130
5.4.1	A Representational Theorem for $\Vdash_{\mathbf{AL}_\Lambda}$	131
5.4.2	The Complete Stage of an Adaptive Proof.	131

5.4.3	A Representational Theorem For $\vdash_{\mathbf{AL}_\Lambda}$ and Related Results	132
5.4.4	Soundness and Completeness	134
5.5	Other Meta-Theoretic Properties of \mathbf{AL}_Λ	135
5.5.1	Cumulativity and Equivalent Premise Sets	135
5.5.2	Some Classes of Cumulative Λ -Based ALs	138
5.5.3	Reassurance	139
5.5.4	The Upper Limit Logic and the Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic	140
5.5.5	Further Properties	141
5.6	Simplifying the Proof-Theory for a Subclass of Λ -Based ALs	142
5.7	Normal Selections: The Logic \mathbf{AL}_Λ^n	143
5.8	Wrapping Things Up: Some Concrete Classes of Λ -Based ALs	145
5.8.1	The Threshold Functions \min_{\prec} , Ψ_{\prec} , and $\Psi_{[\prec_1, \dots, \prec_n]}$	145
5.8.2	The Standard Format	146
5.8.3	(Co)-Lexicographic ALs	147
5.8.4	More on Quantitative Variants	148
5.9	Conclusion	150
	References	152

Part II Default Reasoning

6	Adaptively Applying Modus Ponens in Conditional Logics of Normality	157
6.1	Introduction	157
6.1.1	Some Background	157
6.1.2	Contribution and Structure of this Chapter	159
6.2	Conditional Logics, Their Core Properties and Related Work	160
6.3	Modus Ponens in Conditional Logics of Normality	163
6.4	Applying Modus Ponens Conditionally	166
6.5	Discussion	172
6.5.1	Some Advantages of the Adaptive Approach	172
6.5.2	The Drowning Problem	174
6.5.3	Taking Into Account Negative Knowledge	175
6.6	Conclusion and Outlook	176
	References	176

7	An Adaptive Logic for Rational Closure	181
7.1	Rational Closure	184
7.1.1	Preferential Entailment	186
7.1.2	Rational Entailment	188
7.1.3	Ranked and Rational Models	189
7.1.4	Constructing a Model for Rational Closure	192
7.2	An AL for Rational Closure	193
7.2.1	The Logic R	194
7.2.2	The Lower Limit Logic R ⁺	195
7.2.3	The Adaptive Logic ARC ^s	200
7.3	Including Negative Knowledge	204
7.4	Conclusion	204
	References	205

Part III Argumentation Theory

8	Towards the Proof-Theoretic Unification of Dung's Argumentation Framework: An Adaptive Logic Approach	209
8.1	Introduction	209
8.2	Dung's Argumentation Framework: Key Terms	211
8.3	A Logic for Abstract Argumentation	214
8.3.1	Language and Rules	214
8.3.2	Representing AFs as Premise Sets	218
8.3.3	Representational Requirements	219
8.3.4	Interpreting a Premise Set as Normally as Possible	220
8.3.5	The Problem of an Interpretative Surplus	221
8.3.6	A Better Solution: Going Adaptive and Enabling External Dynamics	223
8.3.7	External Dynamics: Letting New Information In	226
8.3.8	The Minimal Abnormality Strategy and Final Derivability	227
8.4	The AL Framework for Skeptical Acceptance	230
8.5	Adaptive Logics for Credulous Acceptance	233
8.6	Discussion	237
8.7	Conclusion	239
	References	239
9	Allowing for Joint Attacks	243
9.1	Motivation	243
9.2	Complex Argumentation Frameworks	244
9.3	Extension Types	246
9.4	Allowing for Joint Attacks in the Lower Limit Logics	247

9.5	Representing Complex Argumentation Frameworks as Premise Sets.	249
9.6	Going Adaptive	250
9.7	Conclusion.	253
	References	253

Part IV Deontic Logics

10 Avoiding Deontic Explosion by Contextually Restricting

	Modal Inheritance	257
10.1	Introduction	257
10.2	Dealing with Deontic Conflicts by Restricting Inheritance. . .	259
10.3	The Semantics of DPM	262
10.4	Some Shortcomings of DPM	263
10.5	Adaptive Logics	265
10.6	The Adaptive Logic ADPM.1	267
10.7	The Adaptive Logic ADPM.2'	271
10.8	Some Meta-Theoretical Properties.	273
10.9	Shortcomings and Related Work.	274
10.10	Conclusion.	276
10.11	Outlook.	277
	10.11.1 Obligation-Permission Conflicts: Towards More Conflict-Tolerant Deontic Logics	277
	10.11.2 Going Conditional.	278
	References	279

11 An Adaptive Logic Framework for Conditional

	Obligations and Deontic Dilemmas	281
11.1	Introduction	281
11.2	The Problem With Strengthening the Antecedent	283
11.3	Lou Goble's CDPM	284
11.4	A Critical Analysis	286
	11.4.1 CDPM.1c Validates (PRatMono)	286
	11.4.2 Explosive Behavior and Other Problems With (WRM)	286
	11.4.3 Solving the Problems by Further Restricting (WRM)	287
	11.4.4 A Problem with Aggregation and (S)	288
11.5	Going Adaptive: The Conditional Case	289
	11.5.1 Applying Inheritance Conditionally.	290
	11.5.2 Applying Weak Rationality Conditionally	291

11.6	Combining the Adaptive Systems	293
11.7	Conclusion.	294
	References	295
12	A Deontic Logic Framework Allowing for Factual	
	Detachment	297
12.1	Introduction	297
12.1.1	Monadic Approaches to Conditional Obligations. . .	298
12.1.2	Dyadic Approaches and the Problem of Detachment	299
12.1.3	The Contribution and Structure of this Chapter. . .	300
12.2	What to Detach?.	301
12.2.1	Exceptional Contexts and Specificity.	302
12.2.2	Violation Contexts and Contrary-to-Duty Obligations.	303
12.2.3	The Dissent in the Literature	304
12.2.4	Instrumental and Proper Obligations	306
12.2.5	Carmo and Jones' Proposal	309
12.3	Formally Realizing Detachment	311
12.3.1	Blocking Proper Detachment	313
12.3.2	Blocking Instrumental Detachment	314
12.3.3	Realizing Detachment by an Adaptive Logic	314
12.4	A Generic Adaptive Logic for Detachment	315
12.5	A Lower Limit: Lou Goble's CDPM	316
12.6	Handling Detachment Adaptively	318
12.6.1	Context Shifts.	320
12.6.2	Deontic Conflicts	324
12.7	Modeling Nested Permissible Contexts	325
12.7.1	Generalizing L^+ for Nested Permissible Contexts.	325
12.7.2	Adaptively Applying Detachment	329
12.8	Discussion	330
12.9	Conclusion.	332
	References	332
	Appendices	335
	References	432
	Index	433

Adaptive Logics for Defeasible Reasoning
Applications in Argumentation, Normative Reasoning
and Default Reasoning

Straßer, C.

2014, XVIII, 438 p. 34 illus., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-319-00791-5