

Contents

1	Same-Sex Couples, Legislators and Judges. An Introduction to the Book	1
	Daniele Gallo, Luca Paladini, and Pietro Pustorino	
Part I Selected National Jurisdictions		
Section 1 Domestic Law Issues		
2	The Recognition of Same-Sex Couples’ Rights in the US Between Counter-Majoritarian Principle and Ideological Approaches: A State Level Perspective	15
	Graziella Romeo	
3	From Gay Rights to Same-Sex Marriage: A Brief History Through the Jurisprudence of US Federal Courts	33
	Antonio D’Aloia	
4	Different Approaches, Similar Outcomes: Same-Sex Marriage in Canada and South Africa	73
	Edmondo Mostacci	
5	Same-Sex Couples Before Courts in Mexico, Central and South America	93
	José Miguel Cabrales Lucio	
6	Following the Legislative Leaders: Judicial Recognition of Same Sex Couples in Australia and New Zealand	127
	Olivia Rundle	
7	The Nordic Model: Same-Sex Families in Love and Law	161
	Hrefna Friðriksdóttir	
8	A Glorious Revolution? UK Courts and Same-Sex Couples	181
	Aidan O’Neill	

9	Between Recognition and Homophobia: Same-Sex Couples in Eastern Europe	211
	Adam Bodnar and Anna Śledzińska-Simon	
10	Same-Sex Couples in France and Belgium: The Resilient Practice of Judicial Deference	249
	Philippe Reyniers	
11	At the Crossroads Between Privacy and Community: The Legal <i>Status</i> of Same-Sex Couples in German, Austrian and Swiss Law	263
	Giorgio Repetto	
12	Judicial Restraint and Political Responsibility: A Review of the Jurisprudence of the Italian, Spanish and Portuguese High Courts on Same-Sex Couples	287
	Tiago Fidalgo de Freitas and Diletta Tega	
13	The Legal Situation of Same-Sex Couples in Greece and Cyprus	319
	Spyridon Drosos and Aristoteles Constantinides	

Section 2 Private International Law Issues

14	The Law Applicable to the Formation of Same-Sex Partnerships and Marriages	343
	Roberto Virzo	
15	On Recognition of Foreign Same-Sex Marriages and Partnerships	359
	Giacomo Biagioni	
16	Same-Sex Families Across Borders	381
	Matteo M. Winkler	

Part II Supranational and International (and *Quasi*-) Jurisdictions

Section 1 Human Rights Law Issues

17	Same-Sex Couples Before the ECtHR: The Right to Marriage	399
	Pietro Pustorino	
18	Same-Sex Couples' Rights (Other than the Right to Marry) Before the ECtHR	409
	Francesco Crisafulli	
19	Same-Sex Couples Before the Inter-American System of Human Rights	437
	Laura Magi	

Section 2 EU Law Issues

- 20 Free Movement Rights for Same-Sex Couples Under EU Law: What Role to Play for the CJEU?** 455
Jorrit Rijpma and Nelleke Koffeman
- 21 Employment Benefits for Same-Sex Couples: The Case-Law of the CJEU** 493
Massimo F. Orzan

Section 3 International Labour Law Issues and *Quasi*-Jurisdictional Bodies

- 22 International Administrative Tribunals and Their *Non-Originalist* Jurisprudence on Same-Sex Couples: ‘Spouse’ and ‘Marriage’ in Context, Between Social Changes and the Doctrine of *Renvoi*** 511
Daniele Gallo
- 23 Same-Sex Couples Before *Quasi*-Jurisdictional Bodies: The Case of the UN Human Rights Committee** 533
Luca Paladini

Detail Contents

Foreword	v
Gráinne de Búrca	

List of contributors	xxvii
---------------------------------------	-------

1 Same-Sex Couples, Legislators and Judges. An Introduction to the Book	1
Daniele Gallo, Luca Paladini, and Pietro Pustorino	
1.1 A Brief Prologue: Harry, Sally and the Present Time	2
1.2 Aim and Scope	3
1.3 Structure	4
1.3.1 Part I: National Jurisdictions	4
1.3.2 Part II: Supranational and International (and <i>Quasi</i> -) Jurisdictions	5
1.4 The <i>Vis Expansiva</i> of Same-Sex Couples's Rights Across the World and the Role of the Judiciary	6
1.5 Interactions, Dialogues and the Rights of Same-Sex Couples	7
1.6 'Couple', 'Family', 'Marriage', 'Sex' in Context and Related Problems Concerning Legitimacy, Democracy and the Separation of Powers	9
1.7 A Working Tool	11
References	11

Part 1 Selected National Jurisdictions

Section 1 Domestic Law Issues

2 The Recognition of Same-Sex Couples' Rights in the US Between Counter-Majoritarian Principle and Ideological Approaches: A State Level Perspective	15
Graziella Romeo	

2.1	The Recognition of Rights Between Counter-Majoritarian Dilemma and Ideological Approaches	15
2.2	Marriage Federalism and Its Implications	18
2.3	Courts, Legislature and Public Debate	21
2.4	The Choice Over the Scheme of Argumentation in State Litigation	22
2.4.1	Equal Protection v. Due Process	24
2.5	Models of Recognizing Same-Sex Couples' Rights: A Kaleidoscopic Framework	27
2.6	Final Remarks	29
	References	31
3	From Gay Rights to Same-Sex Marriage: A Brief History Through the Jurisprudence of US Federal Courts	33
	Antonio D'Aloia	
3.1	Introductory Remarks. Same-Sex Marriage at the Crossroads: Between State and Federal Legislative and Judicial Powers	33
3.2	The <i>Bowers</i> Case: A Wall with Many Cracks on the Road Towards Gay Rights Recognition	35
3.3	After <i>Bowers</i> : <i>Romer v. Evans</i> and Justice Kennedy's Doctrine . . .	39
3.4	A Parallel Story: The First Same-Sex Marriage Cases in Federal Courts	41
3.5	The Federal Congress' 'Studs Up Tackle': DOMA and the Power to Reserve Marriage to Opposite-Sex Couples	43
3.6	Constitutional Problems Raised by DOMA. The Full Faith and Credit Clause in the Conflict Between the Judicial and Legislative Branches, and the 'Incidents' of Federalism	45
3.7	Development of the Federal Case-Law on DOMA	49
3.8	<i>Lawrence</i> , or the Case That Put a Positive End to the Quest for Individual Gay Rights and Opened Up the Possibility of Homosexual Partnership and Same-Sex Marriage	53
3.9	Beyond the Question of Powers and Federalism. Same-Sex Marriage and the Embarrassing (and, Perhaps, Not Entirely Correct) Comparison with the Precedent of the Interracial Marriage Ban (the <i>Loving</i> Case)	57
3.10	<i>United States v. Windsor</i> and <i>Hollingsworth v. Perry</i> : The Final Turning Point. The US Supreme Court Declared Section 3 of DOMA Unconstitutional	58
3.11	Final Remarks: Some Doubts Concerning Same-Sex Marriage, the Anti-Discrimination Principle, and Homosexual Parenting . . .	66
	References	70
4	Different Approaches, Similar Outcomes: Same-Sex Marriage in Canada and South Africa	73
	Edmondo Mostacci	
4.1	Canada and South Africa: Different Approaches with Similar Outcomes	73

4.2	Same-Sex Marriage in the Courts: The Initial Experience in Canada	75
4.2.1	Continued: Its Consequences for the Approach to the Issue of Rights for Same-Sex Couples	77
4.3	The Rights of Same-Sex Couples and Discrimination on the Grounds of Sexual Orientation in the 1990s	78
4.4	The Courts, the Federal Parliament and the Recognition of Same-sex Marriage	82
4.5	The Constitution of the Rainbow Nation and Sexual Orientation . . .	85
4.6	Recognition of Same-Sex Unions, from <i>Langemaat</i> to <i>Fourie</i> . . .	87
4.7	The Recognition of Same-Sex Couples Between the Courts and the Legislature: Some Comparative Comments	89
	References	91
5	Same-Sex Couples Before Courts in Mexico, Central and South America	93
	José Miguel Cabrales Lucio	
5.1	Introduction	93
5.2	The Situation of Same-Sex Couples in Latin America	94
5.3	Mexico	97
5.3.1	General Overview	97
5.3.2	Mexico City	97
5.3.2.1	Civil Unions: The ‘Law for Coexistence Partnerships’	97
5.3.2.2	Same-Sex Marriage: The 2009 Reform	98
5.3.2.3	Same-Sex Marriage: Court Decisions	98
5.3.2.4	Social Security and Social Rights for Same-Sex Couples	100
5.3.3	Mexican Federal States	101
5.4	Central America	104
5.4.1	Guatemala	104
5.4.2	Costa Rica	104
5.4.2.1	Court Decisions	105
5.4.2.2	Electoral and Constitutional Battle Over the Bill on Same-Sex Civil Unions	106
5.4.3	El Salvador	107
5.5	South America	109
5.5.1	Colombia	109
5.5.1.1	Constitutional Framework and Court Decisions . . .	109
5.5.1.2	Legislative Reactions to the Decisions of the Constitutional Court	113
5.5.2	Venezuela	113
5.5.3	Ecuador	114
5.5.4	Brazil	114
5.5.5	Chile	118

5.5.5.1	The Constitutional Court Rejects Same-Sex Marriage	118
5.5.5.2	Bills on Same-Sex Couples	119
5.5.5.3	Lack of Protection at the National Level: The <i>Atala Riffo</i> Case	119
5.5.6	Uruguay	120
5.5.7	Argentina	122
5.5.7.1	General Overview	122
5.5.7.2	Court Decisions	122
5.5.7.3	Court Decisions in Buenos Aires: Constitutional Principles Supporting Same-Sex Marriage	122
5.5.7.4	Legislative Reaction to Judicial Decisions	124
	References	124
6	Following the Legislative Leaders: Judicial Recognition of Same Sex Couples in Australia and New Zealand	127
	Olivia Rundle	
6.1	Introduction	127
6.2	Australia	128
6.2.1	Background: The Australian Legal Order	128
6.2.2	Same-Sex Marriage	131
6.2.3	Same-Sex Relationship Recognition	133
6.2.3.1	Non-Married Relationship Registration	133
6.2.3.2	<i>De Facto</i> Recognition of Same-Sex Couples	134
6.2.3.3	Judicial Recognition of Same-Sex Couples	136
6.2.4	Same-Sex Parenting	139
6.2.4.1	Judicial Recognition of Legal Parentage	140
6.2.4.2	Judicial Views on Parenting by Same-Sex Couples	141
6.3	New Zealand	142
6.3.1	Background: The New Zealand Legal Order	143
6.3.2	Same-Sex Marriage	144
6.3.3	Same-Sex Relationship Recognition	148
6.3.3.1	Non-Married Relationships Registration	148
6.3.3.2	<i>De Facto</i> Recognition of Same-Sex Couples	149
6.3.3.3	Judicial Recognition of Same-Sex Couples	149
6.3.4	Same-Sex Parented Families	152
6.3.4.1	Legal Parentage	152
6.3.4.2	Parenting by Same-Sex Couples	155
6.4	Comparison of Australia and New Zealand	156
6.4.1	Legal Orders and Human Rights Frameworks	156
6.4.2	Marriage Inequality	157

6.4.3	Treatment of Same-Sex Couples	158
6.4.4	Recognition of Same-Sex Parents	158
6.5	Conclusion	159
	References	159
7	The Nordic Model: Same-Sex Families in Love and Law	161
	Hrefna Friðriksdóttir	
7.1	Introduction	161
7.2	Nordic Family Law and Same-Sex Relationships	162
7.2.1	The Nordic Model	162
7.2.2	The Nordic Legal Family	163
7.2.3	Nordic Milestones	164
7.2.4	Same-Sex Relationships in the Nordic Countries	165
7.2.4.1	Denmark	165
7.2.4.2	Norway	169
7.2.4.3	Sweden	170
7.2.4.4	Iceland	174
7.2.4.5	Finland	175
7.3	Conclusionary Remarks	176
	References	179
8	A Glorious Revolution? UK Courts and Same-Sex Couples	181
	Aidan O'Neill	
8.1	Introduction: From the Period of Criminalisation to That of Liberalization	182
8.2	The UK's Approach to Same-Sex Conduct and Couples: The Interaction Between the European Court of Human Rights and National Courts	183
8.2.1	Gays Openly in the Military	184
8.2.2	Equalisation of the Age of Consent Between Gay and Straight	185
8.2.3	Children and Their Gay Parents	185
8.2.4	Death and the Same-Sex Couple	186
8.3	The UK's Approach to Same-Sex Couples: The Influence of EU Law	187
8.3.1	The EU Legislature Prohibits Sexual Orientation Discrimination in the Workplace	187
8.4	Same-Sex Couples in the Twenty-First Century: The UK Legislature Becomes the Motor for Change in the UK	188
8.4.1	Civil Partnerships and Same Sex Marriages	189
8.4.1.1	Same Sex Marriages and Civil Partnerships Have Nothing (Expressly) to Do with Sex	189
8.4.1.2	Same Sex Marriages and Civil Partnerships and Religious Ceremonies	190
8.4.1.3	Conscientious Objection and the Civil Registrar	194

8.4.2	The Equality Act 2010 and Its Application	196
8.4.2.1	Marriage and Civil Partnership to Be Treated as of Equivalent Status Within the ambit of EU Law	196
8.4.2.2	Prohibition Against Sexual Orientation Discrimination Extended to Provision of Goods and Services to the Public and to All Functions of a Public Law Nature	197
8.4.2.3	Duty on Public Sector Bodies Actively to Promote Equality Between Gay and Straight	198
8.4.2.4	Homophobia and Freedom of Expression	199
8.4.2.5	Equality of Treatment of Gay and Straight Received by the UK Courts as a General Principle of (Common) Law	200
8.4.2.6	Statutory “Ministerial Exemption” from Prohibition on Sexual Orientation Discrimination	201
8.4.2.6.1	UK Ministerial Exemption Incompatible with EU Law?	203
8.4.2.6.2	Ministerial Exemption for Religious Employers and the Strasbourg Jurisprudence	204
8.5	Conclusions	206
	References	209
9	Between Recognition and Homophobia: Same-Sex Couples in Eastern Europe	211
	Adam Bodnar and Anna Śledzińska-Simon	
9.1	Introduction	212
9.2	The Eastern European Countries’ Approach to LGBT Rights and Same-Sex Couples in Brief	213
9.2.1	National Constitutions	213
9.2.2	Membership in the Council of Europe	216
9.2.3	Membership in the EU	217
9.3	The Link Between Recognition of Same-Sex Couples and Homophobia	219
9.4	The Interplay Between Courts and Parliaments in Recognition of Same-Sex Couples	223
9.4.1	Croatia	223
9.4.2	Hungary	227
9.4.3	Slovenia	230
9.5	Judicial Recognition of the Rights of Same-Sex Couples: The Case of Poland	233
9.5.1	The Emergence of the LGBT Movement and Failures to Recognize Same-Sex Couples in Law	233
9.5.2	<i>Kozak v. Poland</i> : The Right to Enter into a Lease Agreement After a Partner’s Death	237

9.5.3	The Rights of Same-Sex Couples Exercising Their Freedom of Movement in the EU	239
9.5.3.1	The Right to Obtain a Non-marriage Certificate and a Certificate for the Legal Capability to Enter into Marriage	239
9.5.3.2	The Right to the Recognition of a Same-Sex Registered Partnership or Marriage Concluded in Another Member State	241
9.5.3.3	The Right to Move and Reside in a Member State by a Third Country National Who Is a Same-Sex Partner of an EU Citizen	242
9.5.4	The Right to the Recognition of Same-Sex Couples in Poland in Light of the ECHR	243
9.6	Conclusions	244
	References	245
10	Same-Sex Couples in France and Belgium: The Resilient Practice of Judicial Deference	249
	Philippe Reyniers	
10.1	Political and Institutional Contexts	249
10.2	France	250
10.2.1	Overcoming Homosexuality as a Deviant Conduct	250
10.2.2	Early Recognition of Same-Sex Couples	251
10.2.3	Same-Sex Marriage	253
10.3	Belgium	255
10.3.1	Overcoming the Conception of Homosexuality as Deviant Conduct	255
10.3.2	Early Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships	257
10.3.3	Same-Sex Marriage	258
10.3.4	Same-Sex Parenthood	260
10.4	Conclusion	262
	References	262
11	At the Crossroads Between Privacy and Community: The Legal Status of Same-Sex Couples in German, Austrian and Swiss Law	263
	Giorgio Repetto	
11.1	Introduction	263
11.2	The Status of Same-Sex Couples in German Law	265
11.2.1	Constitutional Background	265
11.2.2	The Emergence of Same-Sex Relationships Issues and the Right to Marriage: The Different Cohabitation Regimes	267
11.2.2.1	Same-Sex Marriage	267
11.2.2.2	<i>De Facto</i> Homosexual Couples	269
11.2.2.3	Registered Partnerships (<i>Lebenspartnerschaft</i>)	270

11.3	The <i>Status</i> of Same-Sex Couples in Austrian Law	277
11.3.1	Constitutional Background and the Introduction of Registered Partnerships in 2010	277
11.3.2	The Enjoyment of Social Rights by Registered Partners	279
11.3.3	The Enjoyment of Parental Rights by Registered Partners	279
11.4	The <i>Status</i> of Same-Sex Couples in Swiss Law	280
11.4.1	Constitutional Background and the Introduction of Registered Partnership in 2007	280
11.4.2	The Enjoyment of Social Rights by Same-Sex Couples	281
11.4.3	The Enjoyment of Parental Rights by Registered Partners	282
11.5	Conclusions: The “Central European” Model of Same-Sex Partnership at the Crossroads Between Symbols and Reality . . .	283
	References	284
12	Judicial Restraint and Political Responsibility: A Review of the Jurisprudence of the Italian, Spanish and Portuguese High Courts on Same-Sex Couples	287
	Tiago Fidalgo de Freitas and Diletta Tega	
12.1	Introduction	288
12.2	Italy	289
12.2.1	Introductory Remarks	289
12.2.2	Decision No. 138 of 2010 of the Italian Constitutional Court	291
12.2.3	The ECtHR’s Judgement in <i>Schalk and Kopf v. Austria</i>	294
12.2.4	Decision No. 4184 of 2012 of the Italian Supreme Court of Cassation	296
12.2.5	Concluding Remarks	298
12.3	Spain	299
12.3.1	Introductory Remarks	299
12.3.2	Law No. 13/2005 and Case No. 198/2012 of the Constitutional Court	300
12.3.3	Concluding Remarks	304
12.4	Portugal	304
12.4.1	Introductory Remarks	304
12.4.2	Case n. 359/2009 of the Constitutional Court	305
12.4.3	Law No. 9/2010 and Case n. 121/2010 of the Constitutional Court	308
12.4.4	Concluding Remarks	313
	References	314

13	The Legal Situation of Same-Sex Couples in Greece and Cyprus . . .	319
	Spyridon Drosos and Aristoteles Constantinides	
13.1	Introduction	319
13.2	Legal Framework	321
13.2.1	Greece	321
13.2.2	Cyprus	324
13.3	Case-Law	325
13.3.1	Greece	325
13.3.1.1	The Meaning of ‘Marriage’ Under the Greek Civil Code	325
13.3.1.2	The Exclusion of Same-Sex Couples from Civil Unions Before the Strasbourg Court . . .	329
13.3.2	Cyprus	333
13.3.2.1	Reports of the Ombudsman: Discrimination Against Same-Sex Couples	333
13.3.2.2	Reports of the Ombudsman: Recommending the Introduction of Civil Partnership for Both Opposite-Sex and Same-Sex Couples	336
13.3.2.3	The Supreme Court Decision in <i>Correia and Or v. Republic</i>	338
13.4	In Lieu of Conclusion: Towards Introducing Same-Sex Civil Unions in Both Greece and Cyprus (?)	339
	References	340

Section 2 Private International Law Issues

14	The Law Applicable to the Formation of Same-Sex Partnerships and Marriages	343
	Roberto Virzo	
14.1	Preliminary Remarks	343
14.2	Private International Law Issues Concerning the Formation of Same-Sex Registered Unions	344
14.2.1	Applicability of the Conflict of Laws Rules on Contractual Obligations	344
14.2.2	Applicability of the Conflict of Laws Rules on Marriage	346
14.2.3	Special Conflict of Laws Rules and <i>lex loci registrationis</i> as a Connecting Factor	347
14.3	Private International Law Issues Concerning the Formation of Same-Sex Marriages	351
	References	356
15	On Recognition of Foreign Same-Sex Marriages and Partnerships	359
	Giacomo Biagioni	

15.1	Preliminary Remarks	359
15.2	Cross-Border Mobility and Private International Law Implications of Same-Sex Marriages and Civil Unions	362
15.3	Proceedings Involving Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships Before National Courts	365
15.3.1	Proceedings for Registration of Same-Sex Relationships	366
15.3.2	Claims by Same-Sex Couples for Benefits Recognized to Opposite-Sex Couples	367
15.3.3	Proceedings for Divorce or Dissolution of Same-Sex Relationships	368
15.4	Recognition of Foreign Same-Sex Unions in National Courts	370
15.4.1	. . .In States Which Grant Same-Sex Couples Access to Marriage	370
15.4.2	. . .In States Which Grant Same-Sex Couples Access to Civil Unions	372
15.4.3	. . .In States Which Do Not Recognize Same-Sex Unions as Legal	374
15.4.3.1	Non-Existence of a Foreign Same-Sex Marriage	375
15.4.3.2	Public Policy	377
	References	379
16	Same-Sex Families Across Borders	381
	Matteo M. Winkler	
16.1	Introduction	381
16.2	Same-Sex Families in a Transnational Context	382
16.3	Crossing the Border: Conflict-of-Law Aspects of Same-Sex Families	385
16.3.1	Access to Medically Assisted Procreation	385
16.3.2	Joint Adoption by Same-Sex Couples	388
16.3.3	Surrogate Motherhood	390
16.4	Conclusion	393
	References	394
Part II Supranational and International (and <i>Quasi</i>-) Jurisdictions		
Section 1 Human Rights Law Issues		
17	Same-Sex Couples Before the ECtHR: The Right to Marriage	399
	Pietro Pustorino	
17.1	Introduction	399
17.2	<i>Schalk and Kopf</i> : The Proceedings Before the National Courts	400

17.3	The ECtHR's Judgment in <i>Schalk and Kopf</i> : The Reference to Transsexual Cases	401
17.4	The Reasoning of the European Court in <i>Schalk and Kopf</i>	402
17.5	Effects of the Decision in <i>Schalk and Kopf</i> and Future Developments	405
	References	407
18	Same-Sex Couples' Rights (Other than the Right to Marry) Before the ECtHR	409
	Francesco Crisafulli	
18.1	Introduction	409
18.2	Homosexuality and Sexual Intercourse	410
18.3	Private Life and Family Life	417
18.4	Patrimonial Rights	419
18.5	Parental Rights	425
18.6	Expulsion of Aliens	434
	References	436
19	Same-Sex Couples Before the Inter-American System of Human Rights	437
	Laura Magi	
19.1	Introduction	437
19.2	Measures Adopted to Combat Violence and Discrimination Against LGTBI Individuals	439
	19.2.1 Precautionary Measures	440
	19.2.2 IACHR Special Unit	441
19.3	Case Law of the Inter-American Court on Human Rights Concerning LGTBI Individuals	441
	19.3.1 Cases Brought Before IACHR	442
	19.3.2 The Court Judgment in <i>Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile</i>	444
	19.3.2.1 General Remarks	444
	19.3.2.2 Violation of the Right of an Equal Treatment Before the Law	445
	19.3.2.3 Violation of the Right to a Private and Family Life	448
	19.3.2.4 Reparations	452
	References	453
Section 2 EU Law Issues		
20	Free Movement Rights for Same-Sex Couples Under EU Law: What Role to Play for the CJEU?	455
	Jorrit Rijpma and Nelleke Koffeman	
20.1	Introduction	455
20.2	Delineating the Jurisdiction of the CJEU	457

20.3	The Rights of Same-Sex Partners as Fundamental Rights	461
20.4	The Rights of Same-Sex Partners of EU Citizens Under EU Secondary Law	465
20.4.1	Directive 2004/38/EC	466
20.4.1.1	Same-Sex Spouses	468
20.4.1.2	Same-Sex Registered Partners	472
20.4.1.3	Same-Sex Partners	474
20.5	The Rights of Same-Sex Partners of EU Citizens Under EU Primary Law	475
20.5.1	The Existence of a Restriction	476
20.5.2	Possible Justifications	478
20.5.2.1	Public Policy	479
20.5.2.2	National Identity	481
20.5.3	The Implications of Mutual Recognition	483
20.6	Third-Country Nationals and Same-Sex Partners	484
20.7	European Private International Law	487
20.8	Conclusion	489
	References	490
21	Employment Benefits for Same-Sex Couples: The Case-Law of the CJEU	493
	Massimo F. Orzan	
21.1	Introduction	494
21.2	The Jurisprudence Concerning Same-Sex Couples in EU Staff Cases	495
21.2.1	<i>D v. Council</i> and the Adoption of Regulation 723/2004	496
21.2.2	<i>W v. Commission</i> and the Application of New Art. 1(2)(c) of Annex VII to the Staff Regulations	498
21.2.3	The <i>Roodhuijzen</i> Case and the Autonomous Notion of Non-Marital Partnership in the Staff Regulations	499
21.3	Preliminary Rulings: A More Cautious Approach	500
21.3.1	The <i>Grant</i> Case and the Adoption of Directive 2000/78	501
21.3.2	The <i>K.B.</i> Case and the Different Approach of the CJEU to the Discrimination of Transsexuals	502
21.3.3	The <i>Maruko</i> Case and the First (Apparently Revolutionary) Application of the Prohibition of Sexual Orientation Discrimination	504
21.3.4	The <i>Römer</i> Case and the Confirmation of Member States' Freedom to Introduce the Equivalence Between Same-Sex Couples and Married Couples	506
21.4	Conclusion	506
	References	507

Section 3 International Labour Law Issues and *Quasi*-Jurisdictional Bodies

22	International Administrative Tribunals and Their <i>Non-Originalist</i> Jurisprudence on Same-Sex Couples: ‘Spouse’ and ‘Marriage’ in Context, Between Social Changes and the Doctrine of <i>Renvoi</i>	511
	Daniele Gallo	
22.1	Scope of Research: The Jurisprudence of the UNAT and ILOAT as a Privileged Tool of Analysis	511
22.2	The Law Governing Employment Relations Between International Organizations and Their Staff: The Heterogeneous Notion of ‘Family’, ‘Spouse’, ‘Marriage’, and the <i>Renvoi</i> to the Official’s <i>Lex Patriae</i>	513
22.3	The Jurisprudence of the UNAT on Same-Sex Marriage and Partnerships	514
22.3.1	The <i>Berghuys</i> Case: The Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Marriages, But Not Partnerships	515
22.3.2	The <i>Adrian</i> Case: An Atypical (and Indirect) Judicial <i>Revirement</i> and the UN Secretary General’s <i>Activism</i> . . .	517
22.4	The Jurisprudence of ILOAT on Same-Sex Marriage and Partnerships	522
22.4.1	The <i>Geyer</i> Case: Traditional (Heterosexual) Marriages and the <i>Renvoi</i> to the <i>Lex Celebrationis</i>	523
22.4.2	The Case-Law on Same-Sex Marriage and Partnerships, Between a Substantive Approach and the <i>Renvoi</i> to the Staff Members’ <i>Lex Patriae</i>	524
22.4.2.1	The Applicants’ Main Arguments	524
22.4.2.2	The Defendant Organizations’ Main Counter-Arguments	525
22.4.2.3	The Tribunal’s Considerations	527
22.5	Concluding Remarks	528
	References	530
23	Same-Sex Couples Before <i>Quasi</i>-Jurisdictional Bodies: The Case of the UN Human Rights Committee	533
	Luca Paladini	
23.1	Preliminary Remarks	533
23.2	The Human Rights Committee’s Monitor Functions	535
23.2.1	Focus on the Competence to Examine Individual Communications	536
23.2.1.1	Sending and Registration of Individual Communications	536
23.2.1.2	The Admissibility Criteria Under the Protocol	537

23.2.1.3	Pronunciation of Views and the Follow-Up Procedure	539
23.2.1.4	Nature and Authoritativeness of the HRC and Its Views	540
23.3	The HRC Case-Law on LGBT Rights	541
23.4	The HRC Case-Law on Same-Sex Couples Issues	543
23.4.1	The Right to Marry	544
23.4.2	The Right to Benefit from the Deceased Partner's Pension	548
23.4.2.1	The Case of <i>Young v. Australia</i>	549
23.4.2.2	The Case of <i>X v. Colombia</i>	551
23.4.2.3	The Follow-Up of Cases on the Deceased Partner's Pension	552
23.4.2.4	The Potential of Art. 26 ICCPR	553
23.5	Final Remarks	554
23.5.1	Interpretation of the Covenant, Marriage and Same-Sex Partnership	555
23.5.2	HRC as a <i>Forum</i> for Same-Sex Couples	556
	References	557

Same-Sex Couples before National, Supranational and
International Jurisdictions

Gallo, D.; Paladini, L.; Pustorino, P. (Eds.)

2014, XXXIV, 558 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-642-35433-5