

# Contents

|          |   |    |
|----------|---|----|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>   | 1  |
| 1.1      | Adjudicative Committee  | 1  |
| 1.2      | Debate and Reform   | 5  |
| 1.2.1    | Debate over the Adjudicative Function of ACs                                  | 5  |
| 1.2.2    | The Relationship Between Judicial Independence<br>and Accountability          | 8  |
| 1.2.3    | Institutional Reforms of ACs  | 10 |
| 1.3      | Analytic Framework: Understanding Discretion<br>from Bounded Rationality      | 12 |
| 1.3.1    | Discretion: Perspective from Law  | 13 |
| 1.3.2    | Discretion: Perspective from Organizational Studies                           | 14 |
| 1.3.3    | Understanding Discretion from Bounded Rationality                             | 15 |
| 1.4      | Methodology   | 18 |
| 1.4.1    | In-Depth Interviews   | 18 |
| 1.4.2    | Case Studies  | 19 |
| 1.5      | Structure of Book   | 20 |
|          | References  | 21 |
| <b>2</b> | <b>The Organization of the Court</b>  | 25 |
| 2.1      | Court President ( <i>Yuanzhang</i> ): High-Level Link<br>to Outside Resources | 26 |
| 2.1.1    | Function of Court President I: High-Level Link<br>to the Masses               | 27 |
| 2.1.2    | Function of Court President II: High-Level Link<br>to the Party               | 28 |
| 2.1.3    | Conclusion  | 30 |
| 2.2      | Chief Judge ( <i>Tingzhang</i> ): Middle-Line Managers                        | 30 |
| 2.2.1    | Judicial Control I: Participating in Trials                                   | 31 |
| 2.2.2    | Judicial Control II: Presiding over Presiding<br>Judge Joint Meetings         | 32 |

|          |  |            |
|----------|--|------------|
| 2.2.3    | Judicial Control III: Signing and Issuing Judicial Decisions.....        | 33         |
| 2.2.4    | Conclusion.....  | 33         |
| 2.3      | Presiding Judge ( <i>Shenpanzhang</i> ): New Wine in an Old Bottle ..... | 34         |
| 2.3.1    | Formalization of Roles .....   | 34         |
| 2.3.2    | Formalization of Authority Relations.....                                | 36         |
| 2.3.3    | Formalization of Sanctions .....   | 38         |
| 2.3.4    | Conclusion.....  | 40         |
| 2.4      | Responsible Judge ( <i>Chengban Faguan</i> ): First-Line Worker.....     | 41         |
| 2.5      | Conclusion .....   | 42         |
|          | References.....  | 42         |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Committee Goal .....</b>  | <b>47</b>  |
| 3.1      | Goals, Ambiguity, and Discretion .....                                   | 48         |
| 3.1.1    | Rationality, Goals, and Decision-Making .....                            | 48         |
| 3.1.2    | Ambiguity and Discretion .....   | 49         |
| 3.2      | Goals of the AC.....   | 50         |
| 3.2.1    | Judges and Their Goals .....   | 50         |
| 3.2.2    | Concept of Organizational Goals .....                                    | 51         |
| 3.2.3    | Goals of the ACs .....   | 53         |
| 3.3      | Harmony and Justice: Rationality Analysis .....                          | 57         |
| 3.4      | Conclusion .....   | 61         |
|          | References.....  | 61         |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Information Processing.....</b>                                       | <b>65</b>  |
| 4.1      | Information Constraints and Discretion.....                              | 65         |
| 4.2      | Information and Judicial Decision-Making .....                           | 67         |
| 4.3      | AC Communication .....   | 69         |
| 4.4      | Standing Units.....  | 70         |
| 4.5      | Reports and Records .....  | 73         |
| 4.6      | Speech Order.....  | 77         |
| 4.7      | Workload.....  | 82         |
| 4.8      | Conclusion .....   | 86         |
|          | References.....  | 86         |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Committee Composition.....</b>  | <b>91</b>  |
| 5.1      | Multiple Decision Makers and Discretion .....                            | 92         |
| 5.2      | Hierarchical Position.....   | 93         |
| 5.3      | Knowledge .....  | 101        |
| 5.4      | Participation of the Procurator-General .....                            | 107        |
| 5.5      | Conclusion .....   | 110        |
|          | References.....  | 110        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Committee Procedure.....</b>  | <b>115</b> |
| 6.1      | Discretion and Process.....  | 115        |
| 6.2      | General Legal Criteria.....  | 117        |

|          |  |            |
|----------|--|------------|
| 6.3      | Criminal Cases .....   | 118        |
| 6.3.1    | Capital Cases .....  | 119        |
| 6.3.2    | Innocent Cases in Accordance with the Proviso<br>of Article 13 .....                                     | 122        |
| 6.3.3    | Mitigated Cases .....  | 128        |
| 6.3.4    | Summary .....  | 129        |
| 6.4      | Civil and Administrative Cases .....   | 130        |
| 6.4.1    | New-Type Cases .....   | 130        |
| 6.4.2    | Group Action Cases (Quntixing Anjian) .....  | 132        |
| 6.4.3    | Summary .....  | 139        |
| 6.5      | Conclusion .....   | 140        |
|          | References .....   | 140        |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Discretion, Judicial Independence, and Accountability .....</b>                                       | <b>145</b> |
| 7.1      | Discretion and Judicial Independence .....   | 146        |
| 7.2      | Discretion and Judicial Accountability .....   | 146        |
| 7.3      | The Possibility of a Discussion on Judicial<br>Independence in China .....                               | 147        |
| 7.4      | Committee Goals and Independence .....   | 154        |
| 7.5      | Information Processing and Accountability .....  | 156        |
| 7.6      | Committee Composition, Accountability, and Independence .....  | 157        |
| 7.7      | Procedures and Independence .....  | 160        |
| 7.8      | Conclusion .....   | 162        |
|          | References .....   | 162        |
| <b>8</b> | <b>Concluding Remarks .....</b>  | <b>165</b> |
|          | References .....   | 166        |
|          | <b>Appendices .....</b>  | <b>167</b> |
|          | Appendix 1: Question Outline 1 .....   | 167        |
|          | Appendix 2: Question Outline 2 .....   | 177        |
|          | Appendix 3: Question Outline 3 .....   | 182        |
|          | Appendix 4: Question Outline 4 .....   | 185        |
|          | Appendix 5: AC Meeting Minutes of the BPC of G City People's<br>Procuratorate of G City v. Mr. Zhu ..... | 186        |
|          | Appendix 6: The Organization of the Court .....  | 190        |
|          | Appendix 7: Adjudicative Committee Case Report (Criminal Case) .....                                     | 191        |
|          | References .....   | 192        |

Judicial Discretion within Adjudicative Committee

Proceedings in China

A Bounded Rationality Analysis

Li, L.

2014, XIX, 192 p. 3 illus., 2 illus. in color., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-642-54040-0