

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	The NP Argument	2
1.1.1	Empirical Dimension	2
1.1.2	Normative Dimension	5
1.2	The Social Conservationist Argument	5
1.2.1	Empirical Dimension	5
1.2.2	Normative Dimension	8
1.3	Growth of MPAs	11
1.4	Structure of the Book	14
2	The Rise and Rise of the Marine Reserves ‘Bandwagon’	15
2.1	Introduction	15
2.2	Policy Networks	15
2.2.1	Epistemic Community	16
2.2.2	Advocacy Coalitions	19
2.3	Conclusion	23
3	Bibliometric Test of the MR ‘Bandwagon’	25
3.1	Introduction	25
3.2	Methods	25
3.2.1	Social Network Analysis	26
3.2.2	Citation Analysis	26
3.3	Results and Discussion	27
3.4	Conclusion	33
4	Bias in the Peer-reviewed Literature, and Crossing the Science/Policy Divide	35
4.1	Introduction	35
4.2	Pro-MR Bias	36
4.2.1	Methods	37
4.2.2	Results and Discussion	38

4.3	The Science/Policy Divide	45
4.3.1	The Linear Model	45
4.3.2	The Deliberative Model	45
4.3.3	Is Scientific Advocacy of MRs Acceptable?	47
4.4	Conclusion	49
5	Critique of the Scientific Evidence for Fisheries Benefits of MRs	51
5.1	Introduction	51
5.2	Methods	52
5.2.1	Data Collection	52
5.2.2	Literature Classification	52
5.3	Results	53
5.3.1	Empirical Studies	53
5.3.2	Theoretical Studies	59
5.4	Discussion	62
5.4.1	Drawbacks of Targets	62
5.4.2	Skewed Focus of Literature	65
5.4.3	Mixed Evidence	68
5.4.4	Difficulties of Enforcement	79
5.5	Conclusion	80
6	Case Study of the ‘English Patient’	81
6.1	Introduction	81
6.2	Sources of Data	84
6.3	Results and Discussion	85
6.3.1	Planning Work Preceding MCAA Drafting (1999–2006)	85
6.3.2	Planning of MCZs (2006–present)	93
6.3.3	The Outcome of the MCZ Site Selection Process	109
6.4	Conclusion	112
7	Conclusion	113
7.1	Introduction	113
7.2	Summary	114
7.3	Wider Implications	115
7.3.1	Role of Politics in the MR Debate	116
7.3.2	Role of Scientific Advocacy in the MR Debate	120
7.3.3	Role of Stakeholders in the MR Debate	123
7.3.4	Role of Caution in the MR Debate	125
7.3.5	Reconciliation Between NP and SC	128
7.4	Conclusion	133
	References	135

The Controversy over Marine Protected Areas

Science meets Policy

Caveen, A.; Polunin, N.; Gray, T.; Stead, S.M.

2015, XIX, 162 p. 27 illus., 8 illus. in color., Softcover

ISBN: 978-3-319-10956-5