

# Contents

<b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
A. The Factual Perspective: Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes by Sea . . . . .	2
B. The Legal Perspective: Existing Rules and the 1999 Liability Protocol to the Basel Convention . . . . .	5
C. The Structure of This Book . . . . .	8
<b>Chapter 2: The International Trade in Hazardous Wastes and Its Economic Background</b> . . . . .	11
A. Hazardous Wastes: Properties and Economic Importance . . . . .	11
I. Sources and Composition of Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	11
II. Volumes of Generated Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	13
III. Forms of Waste Treatment and Disposal . . . . .	15
IV. The Commercial Value of Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	17
V. Summary . . . . .	19
B. The Transboundary Movement of Wastes . . . . .	19
I. Reasons for the Emergence of Hazardous Waste Movements . . . . .	19
II. Quantities and Typical Patterns of Hazardous Wastes Movements . . . . .	21
III. The Involvement of Waste Brokers and Waste Dealers . . . . .	23
IV. Illegal Traffic and Shipments Off the Official Path . . . . .	24
V. Summary . . . . .	25
C. The Interests Involved . . . . .	26
I. Private Parties . . . . .	26
II. State Interests . . . . .	28
III. Hazardous Waste Trade as “Environmental Racism”? . . . . .	31
IV. Summary . . . . .	32
D. The Risk Potential of Hazardous Waste Movements . . . . .	33

<b>Chapter 3: The Present Legal Framework</b> . . . . .	35
A. The Legal Concept of International Responsibility . . . . .	35
I. The Principle of State Responsibility for Internationally Wrongful Acts . . . . .	37
II. Is There a Need for Autonomous Rules on State Liability for Lawful but Injurious Activities? . . . . .	41
1. “False Cases of Liability Sine Delicto” . . . . .	42
(a) The General Approach . . . . .	42
(aa) Obligations of Conduct and Obligations of Result. . . . .	43
(bb) Distinction Between Legal Acts and Factual Activities. . . . .	44
(cc) Implications for the Application of State Responsibility . . . . .	44
(b) Further Enhancements of this Approach . . . . .	46
(aa) Equation of Activities and Its Consequences . . . . .	46
(bb) A Comprehensive Obligation to Prevent Damage . . . . .	47
(c) Summary . . . . .	49
2. “True Cases of Liability Sine Delicto” . . . . .	49
(a) Explicit Rules of State Liability . . . . .	50
(b) Recognition as a General Principle of International Law? . . . . .	51
(c) Implications of the Non-existence of a General Principle of State Liability . . . . .	52
3. The Relationship Between Both Concepts . . . . .	54
III. The Importance of Civil Liability Conventions . . . . .	55
B. The Contribution of the International Law Commission . . . . .	56
I. State Responsibility . . . . .	57
II. State Liability . . . . .	59
C. State Responsibility in the Context of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes by Sea . . . . .	63
I. Explicit Provisions of State Responsibility in International Treaty Law . . . . .	64
1. The Basel Convention. . . . .	64
(a) Article 12 . . . . .	65
(b) Article 8 . . . . .	65
(c) Article 9 . . . . .	66
(d) Summary . . . . .	67
2. Other Conventions Relevant to the Trade in and Transport of Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	68

3.	The Law of the Sea Convention (UNCLOS) . . . . .	70
4.	Other Conventions Relevant to the Protection of the Marine Environment . . . . .	72
5.	Summary . . . . .	73
II.	The Customary Principle of State Responsibility . . . . .	74
1.	Act of the State . . . . .	75
(a)	State Organs and Persons Empowered by the State . . . . .	76
(b)	Persons in Fact Acting for the State . . . . .	78
(c)	Conduct Ultra Vires . . . . .	78
(d)	Interstate Attribution . . . . .	79
(e)	Persons Solely Acting in Private Capacity . . . . .	80
(f)	Summary . . . . .	81
2.	Breach of an International Obligation . . . . .	81
(a)	Requirements in General . . . . .	81
(aa)	Relevance of the Respective Primary Obligation . . . . .	82
(bb)	A General Requirement of Damage? . . . . .	85
(cc)	A General Requirement of Fault? . . . . .	86
(dd)	Due Diligence as the Relevant Standard of Behaviour . . . . .	88
(b)	Obligations Arising from International Conventions . . . . .	90
(aa)	The Basel Convention . . . . .	90
(1)	Background and Basic Legal Features of the Convention . . . . .	91
(2)	Obligations Imposed on States . . . . .	95
(i)	General Obligation: Minimisation of Generation and Transportation of Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	95
(ii)	First Tier: Absolute Trade Restrictions . . . . .	97
(iii)	Second Tier: Environmentally Sound Management . . . . .	98
(iv)	Third Tier: Prior Informed Consent Principle . . . . .	99
(v)	Further Obligations Imposed by the Basel Convention . . . . .	103
(3)	The Application of the Basel Convention to End-of-Life Ships . . . . .	104
(i)	The Dismantling of End-of-Life Ships . . . . .	104

(ii)	The Definition of “Waste” . . . . .	105
(iii)	Simultaneity of Ship and Waste? . . . . .	109
(4)	Summary . . . . .	110
(bb)	Other Conventions and Regulations Relevant to the Trade in and Transport of Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	111
(1)	The Bamako Convention . . . . .	111
(i)	Background of the Convention . . . . .	111
(ii)	The Obligations Imposed by the Convention . . . . .	113
(iii)	Summary . . . . .	115
(2)	The Waigani Convention . . . . .	116
(3)	The Cotonou Agreement . . . . .	117
(4)	OECD Council Decisions . . . . .	117
(5)	European Union Legislation . . . . .	119
(cc)	The Law of the Sea Convention . . . . .	122
(1)	Background and Basic Legal Features of the Convention . . . . .	122
(2)	Obligations Imposed on States . . . . .	124
(i)	The Obligation to Protect and Preserve the Marine Environment, Articles 192, 194(1) . . . . .	124
(ii)	The Obligation to Prevent Transboundary Pollution to the Marine Environment, Article 194(2) . . . . .	127
(iii)	Further Obligations . . . . .	130
(3)	Summary . . . . .	131
(dd)	Further Conventions Relevant to the Protection of the Marine Environment . . . . .	131
(1)	MARPOL 73/78 Convention . . . . .	131
(2)	OPRC Convention . . . . .	134
(3)	London Dumping Convention . . . . .	135
(4)	The UNEP Regional Seas Programme . . . . .	136
(i)	Regional Seas Conventions . . . . .	136
(ii)	The 1996 Izmir Protocol to the Barcelona Convention . . . . .	138
(iii)	The 1998 Tehran Protocol to the Kuwait Convention . . . . .	140

(ee)	Conventions Relevant to the Trade and Transport of Hazardous Substances . . . .	141
(1)	Rotterdam PIC-Convention . . . . .	141
(2)	Stockholm POPs Convention . . . . .	142
(3)	Hong Kong Convention . . . . .	143
(4)	Agreements and Conventions Concerning the Safe Transport and Handling of Dangerous Goods . . . .	144
(c)	Obligations Arising from General International Law . . . . .	145
(aa)	The Obligation not to Cause Significant Harm to the Environment of Another State's Territory . . . . .	145
(1)	Recognition in International Law . . . .	145
(i)	The Origin of this Obligation . . .	146
(ii)	Exception from the Prevalence of Territorial Integrity in Case of Insignificant Harm . . . . .	148
(2)	The Content of this Obligation . . . . .	149
(i)	Geographical Scope . . . . .	149
(ii)	Prohibitive and Preventive Elements . . . . .	150
(iii)	Legal Character . . . . .	151
(3)	The Burden of Proof . . . . .	151
(4)	Application to Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes by Sea . . . . .	152
(bb)	The Obligation to Protect and Preserve the Marine Environment . . . . .	153
(d)	Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness . . . . .	154
(e)	Summary . . . . .	155
3.	Legal Consequences . . . . .	157
(a)	Continuation of the Primary Obligation . . . . .	158
(b)	Reparation . . . . .	159
(aa)	Causal Link . . . . .	159
(bb)	Forms of Reparation . . . . .	162
(c)	Invocation by the Injured State . . . . .	164
(d)	Serious Breaches of Peremptory Obligations . . . .	165
4.	Jurisdictional Issues . . . . .	166
III.	Summary: State Responsibility . . . . .	166

D. Existing Civil Liability Conventions. . . . .	169
I. 1999 Protocol to the Basel Convention . . . . .	169
1. Evolution of the Protocol . . . . .	169
2. Legal Objectives and Main Content . . . . .	172
II. 1996/2010 HNS Convention . . . . .	174
1. The Evolution of the 1996 HNS Convention and Its Main Content . . . . .	174
2. Perceived Deficiencies and Obstacles to Ratification . . .	176
(a) Contribution of Packaged Cargo to the HNS Fund . . . . .	177
(b) Contributions of the LNG Account . . . . .	178
(c) Non-submission of Contributing Cargo Reports . . .	179
(d) Conclusion. . . . .	179
3. The 2010 Protocol to the HNS Convention and Further Development . . . . .	181
III. Further Civil Liability Conventions . . . . .	183
1. Liability for Oil Pollution from Ships. . . . .	184
2. Liability for Nuclear Damage . . . . .	185
3. Liability for the Carriage of Dangerous Goods by Land . . . . .	185
4. Other Civil Liability Conventions . . . . .	186
IV. Regional Civil Liability Regulations. . . . .	187
1. 1993 Lugano Convention . . . . .	187
2. EU Environmental Liability Directive. . . . .	187
V. The LLMC Convention. . . . .	188
VI. Summary. . . . .	189
E. Relationship Between Civil Liability Conventions and the Principle of State Responsibility. . . . .	190
F. Summary: Responsibility and Liability <i>de lege lata</i> . . . . .	191

#### **Chapter 4: Attempting an Interim Conclusion: Preconditions**

<b>for an Effective Legal Regime on Liability and Compensation . . . . .</b>	<b>193</b>
A. Necessity of a Regime of Liability and Compensation . . . . .	193
I. Insufficiency of Non-financially Oriented Treaty Compliance Mechanisms. . . . .	193
II. Liability Rules as a Remedy for Environmental Damage . . .	196
B. The Appropriate Form of Liability. . . . .	197
I. National, Regional or Global Approach? . . . . .	198
II. State Liability or Civil Liability? . . . . .	199
C. Limitations Set by Other Areas of Law . . . . .	201
D. Summary . . . . .	201

**Chapter 5: The 1999 Basel Protocol on Liability**

<b>and Compensation.</b>	203
A. The Regulatory Content of the Basel Protocol	203
I. Scope of Application	203
1. Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and Other Wastes	204
(a) Wastes Subject to the Basel Protocol	204
(aa) Hazardous Wastes	204
(1) Autonomous Definition	204
(2) National Definitions	205
(bb) “Other Wastes”	206
(cc) Wastes Excluded from the Scope of the Protocol	207
(b) Transboundary Movements and Other Activities Covered by the Protocol	209
(aa) Transboundary Movement	209
(bb) Other Activities	210
2. Incidents Covered by the Basel Protocol	211
(a) Terminological Scope of “Incidents”	211
(b) Geographical and Temporal Coverage of Incidents	212
3. Damage Covered by the Protocol	214
(a) Terminological Scope of “Damage”	214
(aa) Personal Damage and Damage to Property	214
(bb) Loss of Income	215
(cc) Measures of Reinstatement and Preventive Measures	216
(1) Definitions	216
(2) Distinction from Salvage Remuneration	218
(dd) Purely Ecological Damage	221
(g) Geographical Scope of Covered Damage	222
4. Summary	223
II. Relationship to Other Civil Liability Regimes	225
1. Requirements in General	225
(a) Article 3(7) of the Protocol	225
(aa) Legal Requirements	225
(bb) Objections Raised Against This Provision	228
(b) Article 11 of the Protocol	230
(aa) Difficulties Related to the Dual Coverage of Movements	230

	(bb) Meaning of “Portion of a Transboundary Movement” . . . . .	231
	(cc) Insufficiency of the Formal Criterion . . . . .	232
2.	Relationship to Single Civil Liability Instruments . . . . .	234
	(a) Relationship to the HNS Convention . . . . .	234
	(b) Relationship to the CRTD Convention . . . . .	236
	(c) Relationship to the Civil Liability Convention . . . . .	237
	(d) Relationship to Other Regimes of Liability and Compensation in the Field of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes . . . . .	238
	(e) Relationship to the OECD and EU Regulations . . . . .	238
	(f) Relationship to Regimes of Liability for Cargo Damage . . . . .	239
	(g) Relationship to the LLMC Convention . . . . .	239
3.	Summary . . . . .	241
III.	The Liability Regime of the Basel Protocol . . . . .	243
1.	The Basic Concept of Liability of the Basel Protocol . . . . .	244
	(a) The Concept of Combining Strict and Fault-Based Liability . . . . .	244
	(b) No Subsidiary Liability of the State . . . . .	245
	(c) Common but Differentiated Civil Liabilities? . . . . .	246
2.	Strict Liability According to Article 4 . . . . .	248
	(a) The Approach of Channelling Strict Liability According to Spheres of Responsibility . . . . .	248
	(b) Allocation of Strict Liability Under the Basel Protocol . . . . .	251
	(aa) The Regulation in Detail . . . . .	251
	(bb) The Temporal Break When Liability Shifts to the Disposer . . . . .	254
	(cc) Non-establishment of a General Secondary Liability of the Generator . . . . .	255
	(dd) Liability of the Generator for Aftercare Operations . . . . .	257
	(c) Exceptions to Strict Liability . . . . .	258
	(aa) Article 4(5) . . . . .	258
	(bb) Article 6(2) . . . . .	261
3.	Fault-Based Liability According to Article 5 . . . . .	261
4.	The Requirement of a Causal Link . . . . .	263
	(a) Differences Between Strict and Fault-Based Liability . . . . .	263
	(b) Combined Causes of Damage, Article 7 . . . . .	264
5.	Contributory Fault, Article 9 . . . . .	265
6.	Right of Recourse, Article 8 . . . . .	265
7.	Summary . . . . .	267



IV.	The Regime of Limitation of Liability . . . . .	270
1.	Financial Limitation of Liability . . . . .	270
(a)	Potential Conflicts with the LLMC Convention . . .	271
(b)	The Legal Arrangement of Limitation of Liability. . . . .	273
(c)	Practical Implications . . . . .	275
(d)	Procedural Issues . . . . .	277
(e)	Revision of the Financial Limits Established by Annex B . . . . .	277
(f)	Summary . . . . .	278
2.	Temporal Limitation of Liability . . . . .	279
V.	Further Financial Instruments Implemented by the Basel Protocol . . . . .	281
1.	Compulsory Insurance or Similar Guarantees. . . . .	281
2.	The Non-establishment of a Compensation Fund . . . . .	282
(a)	The Need for an Additional Financial Instrument . . . . .	282
(b)	The Utilisation of the Technical Cooperation Trust Fund. . . . .	284
(c)	Interim Solution Insufficient Only upon Entry into Force of the Basel Protocol . . . . .	286
VI.	Rules of Procedures . . . . .	290
1.	Rules on Competent Courts. . . . .	290
2.	Rules on the Applicable Law. . . . .	290
3.	Mutual Recognition and Enforcement of Judgments. . . .	291
VII.	Overview of the Protocol's Final Clauses . . . . .	292
B.	Excursus: The Cases of the M/V "Khian Sea" and the M/V "Probo Koala" . . . . .	293
C.	An Assessment of the Basel Protocol . . . . .	295
I.	Summary of the Major Achievements and the Major Defects of the Basel Protocol . . . . .	295
II.	Reasons for the Protocol's not Entering into Force. . . . .	299
1.	Lack of Political Incentive to Ratify the Basel Protocol . . . . .	299
2.	Shortcomings of the Protocol and Obstacles for Implementation. . . . .	301
3.	Summary. . . . .	302
III.	Consequences of the Protocol's not Entering into Force . . . .	303
<b>Chapter 6:</b>	<b>Concluding Summary. . . . .</b>	<b>305</b>

<b>Appendix I: Text of the Basel Convention (Excerpts) . . . . .</b>	<b>311</b>
<b>Appendix II: Text of the Basel Protocol. . . . .</b>	<b>319</b>
<b>Bibliography . . . . .</b>	<b>335</b>
<b>Table of Cases. . . . .</b>	<b>357</b>
<b>Table of International Conventions and Agreements, OECD, EU and Other Legal Instruments. . . . .</b>	<b>361</b>
<b>About the International Max Planck Research School for Maritime Affairs at the University of Hamburg . . . . .</b>	<b>369</b>

Responsibility and Liability in the Context of  
Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes by  
Sea

Existing Rules and the 1999 Liability Protocol to the  
Basel Convention

Albers, J.

2015, XXV, 370 p., Softcover

ISBN: 978-3-662-43348-5