

Contents

1	The Judicial Role and the Rule of Law	1
	Introduction	1
	Overview of the Book	8
	References	11

Part I The War of Law

2	State Repression and the Rule of Law	15
	Rule of Law and Wicked Rulers	15
	The Ideal of the Rule of Law	15
	Departures from the Ideal	17
	Transition from Rule of Law to Tyranny	19
	Oppression in Legal Forms: Is It Really Law?	22
	Inside and Outside of Law	31
	References	33
3	Repression of the Judiciary	35
	The Need for Legitimacy	35
	Judicial Independence	39
	Purge of the Judiciary and Court Packing	45
	Limits to Jurisdiction and Special Courts	47
	Persuasion and Conditioning of Legal Minds	50
	References	51
4	Judicial Acceptance of Oppression	53
	Acceptance of the Legality of Authoritarian Regimes	53
	Acceptance of Oppressive Aims and Policies	59
	Nazi Anti-semitism	60
	Extension Beyond Race	68
	South African Courts and Apartheid	70
	Agreement with Oppressive Measures in Liberal Societies	74

	Protection of Vital State Interests	74
	Eugenics	77
	Disproportionate Punishment	78
	The Courts and Legal Repression	86
	References	88
5	The Opposition	91
	“The Flame of Law Never Quite Extinguished”	91
	Issues of Legality	93
	Restrictive Interpretation	97
	Opposition in the Twilight of Authoritarianism	108
	Resistance and Legal Method	110
	References	111
 Part II Holding Judges Responsible for Injustice		
6	The Argument for Criminal Liability	115
	Introduction	115
	Methodological Considerations	116
	The Counterarguments	117
	Judges as Culprits	118
	References	122
7	The Condition of Illegality Under International Law	125
	The Legal Basis for the Allied War Crimes Tribunals	125
	The US Military Tribunal Justice Case	126
	The Acquittal of Nazi Judges	130
	References	133
8	The Condition of Illegality and Failed Usurpations	135
	Judges and Revolution	135
	Judges Under Foreign Occupation	136
	References	141
9	The Condition of Illegality in Transitional Settings	143
	The German Post-Nazism Restoration	143
	The Judges of the GDR	148
	References	150
10	Judges in Special Courts	151
	Authoritarian Regimes and Special Courts	151
	The US Military Tribunal and Special Courts	152
	The View on Special Courts in Post-Nazi Germany	154
	Should Taking Office in a Special Court Be Criminal?	156
	References	157

11	Justification of Judicial Oppression	159
	Criminal Intent	160
	The Eilifsen Case	160
	Ignorance of Law	161
	Duress	166
	Discussion	168
	References	169
12	A Special Immunity for Judges?	171
	Obligations and Orders	171
	Immunity and the Role of the Judge	173
	Judicial Independence and Immunity	177
	Division of Power	185
	References	187
13	Holding Judges Responsible	189
	A Fixed Core of Justice	189
	Why Are Not Judges Punished?	191
	The Hurdle of Retroactivity	193
	Does the Responsibility Go Far Enough?	198
	References	201

Part III The Moral Side of Judging

14	The Positivism Thesis	205
	The Reasons for Judicial Complicity	205
	Radbruch and the Discussion on Nazi Germany	208
	References	213
15	What Positivism?	215
	Undefined Positivism	215
	Positivism as Separation of Law and Morality	218
	Positivism as Formalism	220
	Alternatives to Positivism	221
	References	224
16	Alternative Approaches to Legal Interpretation	227
	The Plain Fact Approach to Legal Interpretation	227
	The Dissonance Theory of Robert M. Cover	231
	References	236
17	Beyond Legal Theory as Explanation	237
	Do Legal Theories Influence Judicial Action?	237
	Psychological Factors	239
	Institutional Factors	243
	Entrapment and Erasure of Moral Identity	247
	References	251

18	The Lesser Evil	253
	Administrating the Holocaust	253
	Exemptions from the Rule of Law	256
	The Lesser Evil Defence	259
	Is Resignation the Only Viable Alternative?	267
	A Realistic Calculus	270
	Avoiding the Slippery Slope	271
	References	272
19	Judges for Justice	275
	Coming Out from Behind the Law	275
	Constitutional Provisions Against Acceptance of Authoritarianism?	276
	International Standards	280
	The Politics of Legal Methodology	283
	Resistance for the Rule of Law	292
	References	300

Judges Against Justice

On Judges When the Rule of Law is Under Attack

Graver, H.P.

2015, X, 301 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-662-44292-0