

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Setting the Context	4
1.3	Chapters Outline	6
	References	8
2	Legal Sources and Legal Methodology Under the ICC Statute	11
2.1	Introduction	12
2.2	The ICC Proper Law and Its Interpretation	13
2.2.1	General Considerations	13
2.2.2	The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and Its Applicability to the ICC Statute and the Rules of Procedure and Evidence	15
2.2.3	The Purpose of the ICC	17
2.3	The Use of External Sources and Models for Interpretation	22
2.3.1	The Hierarchy of Norms in Article 21 of the ICC Statute	23
2.3.2	References Under Article 21 of the ICC Statute	27
2.4	Conclusion and Outlook	43
	References	43
3	Previous Approaches to the Exclusion of Illicitly Obtained Evidence	47
3.1	The Approach of the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunals	48
3.1.1	Introduction	48
3.1.2	The General Approach to the Law of Evidence	50
3.1.3	The <i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunals and the Exclusion of Illicitly Obtained Evidence	51
3.1.4	Factors in the Balancing Exercise	55
3.1.5	Potential of the Approach of the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunals for the Construction of the ICC Exclusionary Rule	57

3.2	The Approach of the European Court of Human Rights	58
3.2.1	Introduction	58
3.2.2	The General Approach to the Law of Evidence	59
3.2.3	The ECtHR and the Exclusion of Illicitly Obtained Evidence	60
3.2.4	Factors in the Balancing Exercise	61
3.2.5	Criticism of the ECtHR's Approach	62
3.2.6	Potential of the ECtHR's Approach for the Construction of the ICC Exclusionary Rule	63
3.3	Examples of Domestic Approaches	65
3.3.1	Germany	65
3.3.2	United States	72
3.3.3	England and Wales	79
3.3.4	Canada	85
3.4	Conclusion and Outlook	91
	References	92
4	Development of an Approach to the Exclusion of Evidence by the International Criminal Court	97
4.1	Introduction	98
4.2	The Collection of Evidence in Light of the ICC Cooperation Regime	99
4.3	The Legal Framework for the Exclusion of Evidence	105
4.3.1	The Admissibility of Evidence in General	105
4.3.2	The Purpose of the ICC Exclusionary Rule	110
4.3.3	The Relevant Violations	134
	References	159
5	Factors in the Balancing Exercise	163
5.1	Introduction	164
5.2	The Seriousness of the Crime	164
5.3	The Importance of the Evidence	167
5.4	The Seriousness and Character of the Offence	169
5.4.1	The General Impact of the Seriousness of the Violation	169
5.4.2	Technical Mistakes	171
5.4.3	Automatic Exclusion for Particular Rights?—The Example of Torture	172
5.5	The Actors Involved in the Collection of Evidence	180
5.6	Good Faith	184
	References	187
6	The Relation Between the Violation and the Evidence	189
6.1	Causality and Normative Restriction	190
6.2	An International ' <i>Fruit of the Poisonous Tree Doctrine</i> '?	193
6.2.1	Domestic Approaches	194

6.2.2	The Approach of the European Court of Human Rights	199
6.2.3	The International Level—the Scope of Article 69(7) of the ICC Statute	200
6.3	Consecutive Statements	209
6.3.1	Consecutive Statements in Domestic Proceedings	211
6.3.2	The Case Law of the ICTY	218
6.3.3	Approach Under Article 69(7) of the ICC Statute	219
6.4	Hypothetical Course of Investigations	223
6.4.1	The Validity of Hypothetical Considerations	224
6.4.2	The Probability Standard	230
6.4.3	Hypothetical Considerations and Judicial Warrants	233
	References	237
7	Procedural Aspects	239
7.1	Introduction	240
7.2	The Right to Challenge the Admissibility of Evidence	240
7.3	The Duty to Rule on Admissibility	241
7.4	The Procedural Scope of Application of the ICC Exclusionary Rule	242
7.5	The Timing of a Motion	242
7.6	The Burden and Standard of Proof	244
	References	253
8	Conclusion and Outlook	255
	References	259
	Bibliography	261
	Table of Cases	271
	Legal Documents	283
	Index	287



<http://www.springer.com/978-94-6265-092-3>

Illicitly Obtained Evidence at the International Criminal
Court

Viebig, P.

2016, XII, 291 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-94-6265-092-3

A product of T.M.C. Asser Press