

Contents

1	The Problem of Judicial Independence	1
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Legal Scholarship	3
1.2.1	Introduction	3
1.2.2	Universal Scholars	3
1.2.3	Contextual Scholars	6
1.2.4	Implications for the Study	9
1.3	Judicial Reformers	9
1.3.1	Introduction	9
1.3.2	Development Banks and Donor Agencies	10
1.3.3	Human Rights Advocates	21
1.4	Theoretical Frameworks	27
1.4.1	Introduction	27
1.4.2	The Universal Theory	27
1.4.3	The Pragmatic and Context-Sensitive Theory	30
1.5	Case Study in Brief: Judicial Independence in England	33
1.5.1	Introduction	33
1.5.2	Focus	33
1.5.3	Rationale	35
1.5.4	Conventions	35
1.5.5	Expansion	36
1.5.6	Limitations	38
1.5.7	Summary	40
1.6	Methodology of the Study	40
	References	43
2	Judicial Independence in Malaysia	47
2.1	Introduction	47
2.1.1	Case Study	47
2.1.2	Overview	48

2.1.3	Structure	48
2.2	Context	49
2.2.1	Introduction	49
2.2.2	Historical Development	50
2.2.3	Legal Heritage	52
2.3	Previous Scholarship and Internal Perspectives	52
2.4	Institutional Framework	57
2.4.1	Introduction	57
2.4.2	Overview	58
2.4.3	The Executive	65
2.4.4	The Judiciary	67
2.4.5	The Legislature	84
2.5	Jurisprudence of the Superior Courts	85
2.5.1	Introduction	85
2.5.2	Overview	86
2.5.3	Detentions and National Security	86
2.5.4	1988 Judicial Crisis	89
2.5.5	Trials of Anwar Ibrahim	94
2.5.6	United Nations Special Rapporteur on Judicial Independence	97
2.5.7	Lingam Tape Affair	99
2.6	Review of Judicial Independence	101
2.6.1	Introduction	101
2.6.2	Contemporary Judicial Independence	102
2.6.3	Evolution and Context	109
2.6.4	Future Developments in Malaysia	119
	References	121
3	Judicial Independence in Pakistan	125
3.1	Introduction	125
3.1.1	Case Study	125
3.1.2	Overview	126
3.1.3	Structure	126
3.2	Context	127
3.2.1	Introduction	127
3.2.2	Legal Heritage	128
3.3	Previous Scholarship and Internal Perspectives	129
3.4	Institutional Framework	133
3.4.1	Introduction	133
3.4.2	Overview	133
3.4.3	The Executive	135
3.4.4	The Judiciary	136
3.4.5	The Legislature	149
3.5	Jurisprudence of the Supreme Court I: 1947–1999	151
3.5.1	Introduction	151

3.5.2	Overview	152
3.5.3	Constitutional Wrangling: 1947–1956	152
3.5.4	The 1956 Constitution and Martial Law	158
3.5.5	Muhammad Ayub Khan's Military Government: 1958–1969	159
3.5.6	Agha Mohammed Yahya Khan and the Division of Pakistan: 1969–1971	160
3.5.7	Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's Pakistan: 1971–1977	161
3.5.8	Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's Detention, Trial, and Execution: 1977–1979	166
3.5.9	Muhammad Zia ul Haq's Military Regime: 1977–1988 . . .	168
3.5.10	Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif: 1988–1999	169
3.6	Judicial Independence after the First 50 Years	175
3.7	Jurisprudence of the Supreme Court II: 1999–2016	177
3.7.1	Pervez Musharraf's Military Government: 1999–2005 . . .	177
3.7.2	Judiciary Under Attack: 2005–2008	183
3.7.3	Expanding Judicial Power: 2009–2016	188
3.8	Review of Judicial Independence	203
3.8.1	Introduction	203
3.8.2	Contemporary Judicial Independence	204
3.8.3	Evolution and Context	209
3.8.4	Future Developments in Pakistan	215
	References	216
4	Conclusion	221
4.1	Introduction	221
4.2	Comparing Judicial Independence	222
4.2.1	Introduction	222
4.2.2	Malaysia	223
4.2.3	Pakistan	225
4.2.4	England	226
4.2.5	Contrasts among Malaysia, Pakistan, and England	227
4.2.6	Conclusion	238
4.3	The Universal Theory	238
4.3.1	Introduction	238
4.3.2	Results of the Case Studies	239
4.4	The Pragmatic and Context-Sensitive Theory	242
4.4.1	Introduction	242
4.4.2	Results of the Case Studies	242
4.4.3	Compared with the Universal Theory	244
4.5	Conclusion	245
4.6	Broader Implications	247
	References	250

The Dynamics of Judicial Independence

A Comparative Study of Courts in Malaysia and Pakistan

Neudorf, L.

2017, XIV, 251 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-319-49883-6