

Contents

1	Non-monotonic Voting Methods: An Overview	1
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Types of Monotonicity Failure	4
1.3	The Plan of the Book	8
	References	9
2	Descriptions of the Voting Methods to Be Analyzed	11
2.1	Introduction	11
2.2	Five Voting Methods Susceptible to Types of Monotonicity Failure Under Both Fixed and Variable Electorates	12
2.2.1	Plurality with Runoff (P-R)	12
2.2.2	Alternative Vote (AV; aka Instant Runoff Voting; Ranked Choice Voting)	13
2.2.3	The Coombs Method	13
2.2.4	The Dodgson Method	13
2.2.5	The Nanson Method	14
2.3	Eight Voting Methods Susceptible to Types of Monotonicity Failure Under Variable Electorates	14
2.3.1	Successive Elimination	14
2.3.2	Bucklin's Method	15
2.3.3	Majority Judgment	16
2.3.4	Copeland's Method	16
2.3.5	Black's Method	17
2.3.6	Kemeny's Method	17
2.3.7	Schwartz's Method	18
2.3.8	Young's Method	18
2.4	Five Main Procedures that Are not Susceptible to Any Monotonicity Failure	18
2.4.1	Plurality (or First Past the Post) Voting Procedure	18
2.4.2	Approval Voting	19

2.4.3	Borda's Count	19
2.4.4	Range Voting	20
2.4.5	The Minmax Procedure	20
	References.	21
3	Some Theoretical Results on Monotonicity-Related	
	Properties of Voting Rules	23
3.1	Smith's (1973) Theorem.	23
3.2	Fishburn's (1982) Theorems.	25
3.3	Moulin's (1988) and Pérez's (2001) Theorems.	29
3.4	Saari's (1989) Results.	30
3.5	Muller and Satterthwaite (1977) Theorem.	31
	References.	32
4	Five Voting Rules Susceptible to Types of Monotonicity	
	Failure Under Both Fixed and Variable Electorates.	33
4.1	Introduction	33
4.2	Types of Monotonicity Failure of the Plurality with Runoff Method Under Fixed Electorates.	35
4.2.1	An Initial Situation with a Condorcet Winner	35
4.2.2	An Initial Situation with a Top Cycle	37
4.3	Types of Monotonicity Failure of the Alternative Vote Method Under Fixed Electorates	39
4.3.1	Initial Situation with a Condorcet Winner	39
4.3.2	An Initial Situation with a Top Cycle	40
4.4	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Coombs' Method Under Fixed Electorates	41
4.4.1	An Initial Situation with a Condorcet Winner	41
4.4.2	An Initial Situation with a Top Cycle	43
4.5	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Dodgson's Method Under Fixed Electorates	44
4.5.1	Initial Situation	44
4.6	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Nanson's Method Under Fixed Electorates	48
4.6.1	Initial Situation	49
4.7	Types of Monotonicity Failure of the Plurality with Runoff and the Alternative Vote Methods Under Variable Electorates	52
4.7.1	Impossibility: P-TOP.	52
4.7.2	P-BOT + CW	52
4.7.3	P-BOT + CYC	53
4.8	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Coombs' Method Under Variable Electorates	53
4.8.1	P-TOP + CW	53

4.8.2	P-TOP + CYC.	54
4.8.3	Impossibility: P-BOT.	55
4.9	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Dodgson's Method	
	Under Variable Electorates	55
4.9.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	55
4.9.2	P-TOP + CYC.	55
4.9.3	P-BOT + CW	57
4.9.4	P-BOT + CYC	57
4.10	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Nanson's Method	
	Under Variable Electorates	58
4.10.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	58
4.10.2	P-TOP + CYC.	58
4.10.3	P-BOT + CW	59
4.10.4	P-BOT + CYC	60
4.11	Summary and Conclusions	60
	References.	61
5	Eight Voting Rules Susceptible to Types of Monotonicity	
	Failure Under Variable Electorates	63
5.1	Introduction	63
5.2	Types of Monotonicity Failure of the Successive Elimination	
	Method Under Variable Electorate	64
5.2.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	64
5.2.2	P-TOP + CYC.	64
5.2.3	P-BOT + CW	65
5.2.4	P-BOT + CYC	65
5.3	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Bucklin's Method	
	Under Variable Electorate.	66
5.3.1	P-TOP + CW	66
5.3.2	P-TOP + CYC.	67
5.3.3	P-BOT + CW	68
5.3.4	P-BOT + CYC	68
5.4	Types of Monotonicity Failure of the Majority Judgment (MJ)	
	Method Under Variable Electorate	69
5.4.1	P-TOP + CW	69
5.4.2	P-TOP + CYC.	69
5.4.3	P-BOT + CW	70
5.4.4	P-BOT + CYC	71
5.5	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Copeland's Method	
	Under Variable Electorate.	72
5.5.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	72
5.5.2	P-TOP + CYC.	72
5.5.3	P-BOT + CW	73
5.5.4	P-BOT + CYC	73

5.6	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Black's Method	
	Under Variable Electorate.	74
5.6.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	74
5.6.2	P-TOP + CYC.	74
5.6.3	P-BOT + CW	75
5.6.4	Impossibility: P-BOT + CYC	76
5.7	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Kemeny's Method	
	Under Variable Electorate.	76
5.7.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	76
5.7.2	P-TOP + CYC.	76
5.7.3	P-BOT + CW	77
5.7.4	P-BOT + CYC	78
5.8	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Schwartz's Method	
	Under Variable Electorate.	79
5.8.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	79
5.8.2	P-TOP + CYC.	79
5.8.3	P-BOT + CW	80
5.8.4	Impossibility: P-BOT + CYC	80
5.9	Types of Monotonicity Failure of Young's Method	
	Under Variable Electorate.	81
5.9.1	Impossibility: P-TOP + CW	81
5.9.2	P-TOP + CYC.	81
5.9.3	Impossibility: P-BOT.	82
5.10	Summary and Conclusions	83
	References.	84
6	Practical Significance and Open Problems	85
	References.	88

Monotonicity Failures Afflicting Procedures for Electing
a Single Candidate

Felsenthal, D.S.; Nurmi, H.

2017, VIII, 88 p., Softcover

ISBN: 978-3-319-51060-6