

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Preliminary Reflections upon Interpretative Power	1
1.2	Current State of Research	6
1.3	Scope of this Study	9
1.3.1	Treaty Interpretation	10
1.3.1.1	Treaties	10
1.3.1.2	Interpretation	11
1.3.2	Inter-State Level	14
1.3.2.1	Domestic Judiciaries	14
1.3.2.2	Accessibility and Reliability of Jurisprudence	16
1.3.2.3	Sample Period	17
1.3.3	Intra-State Level	17
1.4	Outline and Methodology	19
 <b>Part I Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>The Origins of Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice</b>	<b>27</b>
2.1	International Legal Doctrine	28
2.1.1	‘Classical’ Writers	28
2.1.2	‘Post-Classical’ Writers	30
2.1.3	State-Sponsored and Private Codification Efforts	34
2.1.4	Conclusion	40
2.2	Judicial Settlement of International Disputes	41
2.2.1	Permanent Court of International Justice	42
2.2.2	International Court of Justice	46
2.2.3	Conclusion	52
2.3	Domestic Jurisprudence	53
2.3.1	Germany	53
2.3.2	Switzerland	55
2.3.3	United States of America	59
2.3.4	Conclusion	63

<b>3</b>	<b>Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice in Context:</b>	
	<b>The 1969 VCLT</b> . . . . .	65
3.1	Genesis of the Vienna Convention and its Rules of Interpretation . . .	66
3.2	The Vienna Rules as a Reflection of Customary Law . . . . .	75
3.3	The Vienna Rules of Interpretation . . . . .	80
3.3.1	The General Rule of Interpretation . . . . .	82
3.3.1.1	Ordinary and Special Meaning. . . . .	83
3.3.1.2	Context. . . . .	87
3.3.1.3	Object and Purpose . . . . .	89
3.3.2	Supplementary Means of Interpretation . . . . .	90
3.3.3	Interpretation as a Single Combined Operation. . . . .	92
<b>4</b>	<b>Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice under</b>	
	<b>Articles 31 and 32 VCLT</b> . . . . .	99
4.1	Relationship between Subsequent Agreements and	
	Subsequent Practice. . . . .	99
4.2	Subsequent Agreements under Article 31(3)(a) VCLT . . . . .	103
4.2.1	‘Agreement’ . . . . .	103
4.2.1.1	Agreement and Treaties . . . . .	104
4.2.1.2	Interpretative Treaties. . . . .	105
4.2.1.3	The Form of Agreement. . . . .	105
4.2.2	‘Between the Parties’ . . . . .	108
4.2.2.1	Who Are ‘the Parties’?. . . . .	108
4.2.2.2	How Many Parties Are ‘the Parties’?. . . . .	112
4.2.3	The Object of the Agreement. . . . .	113
4.2.3.1	Sole Purpose v Unintended Side-Effect. . . . .	113
4.2.3.2	Interpretation and Application Distinguished . . . .	114
4.2.3.3	Interpretation and Modification Distinguished . . .	116
4.2.4	‘Subsequent’ . . . . .	119
4.3	Subsequent Practice under Article 31(3)(b) VCLT . . . . .	121
4.3.1	Objective Components of Subsequent Practice . . . . .	121
4.3.1.1	What Constitutes ‘Practice’?. . . . .	121
4.3.1.2	Whose Practice Counts as ‘Practice’?. . . . .	125
4.3.1.3	‘In the Application of the Treaty’ . . . . .	128
4.3.2	Subjective Components of Subsequent Practice . . . . .	129
4.3.2.1	The Agreement of the Parties. . . . .	129
4.3.2.2	Interpretation and Modification Distinguished . . .	131
4.3.2.3	How to ‘Establish’ the Agreement?. . . . .	133
4.4	‘Other’ Subsequent Conduct under Article 32 VCLT . . . . .	135
4.5	Conclusion . . . . .	137

## Part II The Jurisprudence of Domestic Courts

<b>5</b>	<b>Legal Status and Effects of Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice</b>	141
5.1	The Status of Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice	141
5.1.1	Authentic Means of Interpretation	142
5.1.1.1	The Origins and Re-emergence of ‘Authentic Interpretation’	143
5.1.1.2	Authentic Interpretation in Domestic Jurisprudence	147
5.1.2	Relative Weight in the Interpretative Process	150
5.2	The Effects of Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice	156
5.2.1	Extensive and Restrictive Interpretation	156
5.2.1.1	Different Concepts of Extensive and Restrictive Interpretation	157
5.2.1.2	Extensive and Restrictive Interpretation in Domestic Jurisprudence	158
5.2.2	Dynamic and Static Interpretation	161
5.2.2.1	Defining and Qualifying Dynamic and Static Interpretation	162
5.2.2.2	Dynamic and Static Interpretation in Domestic Jurisprudence	164
5.3	Conclusion	168
<b>6</b>	<b>The Frequency of Subsequent Agreements</b>	171
6.1	The Number of Parties to a Treaty	172
6.2	Solid Evidence of Subsequent Agreements	174
6.3	Constitutional Impediments	179
6.3.1	Negative Impact on Parliamentary Participation Rights	179
6.3.1.1	Parliamentary Participation in Foreign Affairs in Germany	180
6.3.1.2	Different Approaches to the Ratification Requirement	182
6.3.1.2.1	Objective Approach	182
6.3.1.2.2	Mixed Approach	186
6.3.1.3	Parliamentary Participation and Subsequent Practice in Other States	190
6.3.2	Legal Advantages over Other Means of Interpretation	193
6.4	Conclusion	196
<b>7</b>	<b>Practice by Non-Party Entities</b>	199
7.1	The Output of Treaty Bodies	200
7.1.1	The Interpretative Value of Treaty Body Output	202
7.1.2	Treaty Body Output in the Jurisprudence of Domestic Courts	206
7.1.3	Evaluation	212

7.2	The Office of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees . . . . .	214
7.2.1	The Link between the Refugee Convention, the Refugee Protocol, and the UNHCR . . . . .	214
7.2.2	UNHCR Publications in Domestic Jurisprudence . . . . .	217
7.2.3	Evaluation . . . . .	224
7.3	The OECD ‘Model Convention on Income and Capital’ . . . . .	225
7.3.1	The OECD, its Model Convention, and Related Documents . . . . .	227
7.3.2	The OECD Model Convention in Domestic Jurisprudence . . . . .	232
7.3.3	Evaluation . . . . .	237
7.4	Conclusion . . . . .	239
<b>8</b>	<b>The Notion of ‘Agreement’</b> . . . . .	<b>241</b>
8.1	Agreement and Silence . . . . .	242
8.1.1	Eloquent Silence in International Law . . . . .	243
8.1.2	How Domestic Courts Interpret Silence or Inaction . . . . .	246
8.1.3	Evaluation . . . . .	253
8.2	Agreement and Selected Practice . . . . .	254
8.2.1	Ascertaining the Parties’ Agreement . . . . .	255
8.2.2	The Spectrum of Selectivity . . . . .	259
8.2.2.1	Quantitative Selectivity . . . . .	262
8.2.2.2	Regional Selectivity . . . . .	264
8.2.2.3	Qualitative Selectivity . . . . .	266
8.2.3	Selected Practice and Uniform Interpretation . . . . .	269
8.2.4	Evaluation . . . . .	273
8.3	Conclusion . . . . .	275
<b>9</b>	<b>Conclusion and Outlook</b> . . . . .	<b>277</b>
9.1	Ancient Origins but Undiminished Validity . . . . .	278
9.2	Neutral Ingredients for the Crucible . . . . .	280
9.3	The True Masters of the Treaty . . . . .	282
9.4	Towards Uniform Interpretation? . . . . .	284
	<b>Bibliography</b> . . . . .	<b>287</b>

Subsequent Agreements and Subsequent Practice in  
Domestic Courts

Berner, K.

2017, XLV, 300 p. 3 illus., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-662-54936-0