

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Pre-Commercial Procurement ('PCP')—Definition and Background	1
1.2	The Reality of PCP Implementation	3
1.3	Outline of the Book	5
	References	7
<b>2</b>	<b>Political Background to PCP Adoption—An Institutional Approach</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1	Introduction	9
2.2	European Council's Guidance	10
2.3	European Commission's Actions	14
2.3.1	Actions to Promote Public Procurement as Innovation Policy Instrument	14
2.3.2	Actions to Promote PCP Within the EU Innovation Policy	17
2.4	European Parliament's Support	24
2.5	Summing-Up Policy Support for PCP	25
	References	26
<b>3</b>	<b>The Economic Rationale for PCP</b>	<b>31</b>
3.1	Introduction	31
3.2	Innovation Policy as Decision-Making Under Uncertainty	33
3.3	Relation Between Innovation and (Public) R&D Investments	38
3.4	European Venture Capital Markets—Investments in (Risky) R&D	47
3.5	The Impact of Public Needs/Demand on Firms' Strategies for Creativity and Innovation	50
3.6	PCP for the Development of Innovative Services	58
3.7	Conclusion	61
	References	63

<b>4</b>	<b>The US Model of R&amp;D Procurement—Lessons for PCP</b>	69
4.1	Introduction	69
4.2	The Features of the US SBIR Program	70
4.2.1	Legislated Set-Asides	70
4.2.2	The Rationale Behind the SBIR	72
4.2.3	Organisational Features	75
4.3	Quantifying the Impact of the US SBIR Program—The Debate	92
4.3.1	Impact of US SBIR	92
4.3.2	Strengths and Points of Improvement	99
4.4	Lessons for the EU	101
	References	103
<b>5</b>	<b>Placing PCP Within the Legislative Framework</b>	107
5.1	Introduction	108
5.2	The Features of PCP	108
5.2.1	Objectives	108
5.2.2	Non-Mandatory Implementation	109
5.2.3	Direct and Catalytic PCP	110
5.2.4	Phases	110
5.2.5	Eligibility and Award Criteria	112
5.2.6	Summarizing Remarks	113
5.3	Legal Boundaries to PCP Implementation	114
5.3.1	Compliance with the Procurement Directives	114
5.3.2	Compliance with the TFEU Fundamental Principles	119
5.3.3	Compliance with the EU State Aid Rules	120
5.3.4	Compliance with the GPA	122
5.3.5	Summarizing Remarks	123
5.4	Procedural Flexibility in the Deployment of PCP	124
5.4.1	Rebuttable Presumption of Cross-Border Interest and Applicability of Treaty Principles	124
5.4.2	Germany v Commission Case—Resolution of the Disputes?	133
5.4.3	Conclusions	138
5.5	The Concept of R&D Services in PCP	140
5.5.1	Introduction	140
5.5.2	The Frascati Manual on R&D	141
5.5.3	EU Guidance on the Concept of R&D	146
5.5.4	Conclusions	149
5.6	Distinction from Other Innovation Policy Tools	150
5.6.1	PCP and Functional and/or Performance Specifications	151
5.6.2	Competitive Dialogue	151
5.6.3	R&D Subsidies	152
5.6.4	Forward Commitment Procurement	154
5.7	Conclusions	155
	References	156

<b>6</b>	<b>The Realities of Public R&amp;D Procurement Implementation in the EU—Trials and Tribulations</b>	159
6.1	Introduction	159
6.2	PCP's ' <i>State of Play</i> ' in the EU	160
6.3	The UK SBRI	162
6.3.1	Background and Evaluation of SBRI (2001–2008)	162
6.3.2	SBRI—Features of the Latest Version (2008 and Later)	164
6.3.3	SBRI Evaluations	168
6.3.4	Projects	171
6.3.5	Conclusions	172
6.4	The Dutch SBIR	174
6.4.1	Background to Adoption	174
6.4.2	Features of the Dutch SBIR	176
6.4.3	Evaluation	181
6.4.4	Projects	183
6.4.5	Conclusions	185
6.5	The Flemish PoI	187
6.5.1	Description and Initiation Background	187
6.5.2	Features of the Flemish PoI	190
6.5.3	Projects	192
6.5.4	Conclusions	194
6.6	EU Support for PCP	196
6.6.1	The Rationale Behind European Commission's Intervention	196
6.6.2	European Commission Incentivizing Actions	197
6.7	Conclusions	200
	References	202
<b>7</b>	<b>Legal Barriers and Conceptual Pitfalls</b>	203
7.1	Introduction	203
7.2	The EU Project	204
7.3	The Burden of a New Competitive Award After the PCP	207
7.3.1	Introduction	207
7.3.2	The WTO GPA Constrains	208
7.3.3	The EU Procurement Directives & the Purchase of PCP Solutions	215
7.3.4	Conclusions	224
7.4	Interplay Between PCP and EU State Aid Rules	225
7.4.1	Introduction	225
7.4.2	The Market Price Criterion—Before 2014	225
7.4.3	The 2014 Framework for State Aid for R&D&I	229
7.4.4	Applicable Rules to a PCP Subsidy	230
7.5	The Obligation to Ensure a 'Level Playing Field'	238
7.6	Conclusions	241
	References	242
<b>8</b>	<b>Concluding Remarks—the Case for EU Coordination of R&amp;D Procurement</b>	245

Trials and Tribulations in the Implementation of  
Pre-Commercial Procurement in Europe

Apostol, R.

2017, IX, 250 p. 9 illus., 8 illus. in color., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-94-6265-155-5

A product of T.M.C. Asser Press