

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Problem Definition and Research Question	3
1.2	Objects of the Investigation and Conceptual Framework	5
1.3	The Course of the Argument	8
2	International Investment Treaties	11
2.1	Investment Protection Under International Investment Treaties . . .	13
2.1.1	Overview of Protection Standards in International Investment Treaties	14
2.1.2	Development of Investment Protection Under International Treaties	15
2.1.2.1	Friendship, Commerce and Navigation Treaties . . .	15
2.1.2.2	The Proliferation of Bilateral Investment Treaties	19
2.1.2.3	Recent Developments in International Investment Treaty-Making	21
2.1.3	Early Failures of Multilateral International Investment Treaty Attempts	23
2.1.3.1	The Abs-Shawcross Draft Convention on Investments Abroad (1959)	23
	Substantive Law Protection Standards	24
	Procedural Law Protection Standards	25
2.1.3.2	The OECD Draft Convention on the Protection of Foreign Property (1967)	25
	Substantive Law Protection Standards	26
	Procedural Law Protection Standards	27
2.1.4	Significance of Legal Protection Under International Investment Treaties	28
2.1.4.1	Creating a Favourable and Stable Legal Environment	28

2.1.4.2	Enforcement of the Investment Treaty-Shaped Legal Environment	29
2.1.5	The Legal Effect of International Law in Mongolia	29
2.1.5.1	Customary International Law and International Minimum Standard of Treatment of Aliens	29
2.1.5.2	General Principles of Law	32
2.1.5.3	International (Investment) Treaties	33
2.2	Bilateral Investment Treaties	35
2.2.1	Bilateral Investment Treaties Entered into by Mongolia	36
2.2.2	Approach Towards Bilateral Investment Treaties	37
2.2.2.1	The 1990s	37
2.2.2.2	The 2000s	38
2.2.2.3	Approach Analysis	38
2.2.3	Bilateral Investment Treaties Entered into with Member States of the European Union	39
2.2.3.1	The European Union's Exclusive Competence for Foreign Direct Investments	40
2.2.3.2	Regulation (EU) No. 1219/2012 on the Legal Status of Extra-EU Bilateral Investment Treaties Under European Union Law	41
2.2.3.3	Future International Investment Treaties of the European Union	42
2.3	Trade-Related and Sectoral International Treaties with Investment Chapters	44
2.3.1	Preferential Trade and Investment Agreements	45
2.3.1.1	The (Re-) Integration of Investment Rules into International Trade Agreements	45
2.3.1.2	Implications for the Current International Investment Law System	46
2.3.1.3	Preferential Trade and Investment Agreements and Regional Economic Integration in East Asia	49
2.3.2	The Japan-Mongolia Economic Partnership Agreement (2015)	51
2.3.2.1	Contents of the Agreement and Economic Significance	51
2.3.2.2	Chapter 10 of the Agreement Governing Mutual Foreign Investments	52
2.3.2.3	Relation of the Agreement to the Japan-Mongolia BIT (2001)	53
2.3.3	The Energy Charter Treaty (1994)	54
2.3.3.1	Treaty Origin	54
2.3.3.2	Sectoral Scope of Treaty Application	55

2.3.3.3	Investment Protection Under the Energy Charter Treaty	55
2.4	Standards of Investment Protection and Reflection in the International Investment Treaties of Mongolia	57
2.4.1	Scope of Application of International Investment Treaties	58
2.4.2	Substantive Law Protection Standards in International Investment Treaties	59
2.4.2.1	National Treatment	59
	Overview of Content and Application of the Standard	60
	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	63
2.4.2.2	Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment	64
	Overview of Content and Application of the Standard	64
	The Extension of Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment to Dispute Settlement Clauses	66
	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	68
2.4.2.3	Fair and Equitable Treatment	69
	Fair-and-Equitable-Treatment Clauses Linked to (Customary) International Law	70
	Unqualified Fair-and-Equitable-Treatment Clauses as Autonomous Legal Standard	71
	Principles of Protection Commonly Associated with Fair and Equitable Treatment	73
	The Doctrine on the Protection of Legitimate Expectations	78
	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	82
2.4.2.4	Full Protection and Security	83
	Overview of Content and Application of the Standard	83
	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	89
2.4.2.5	Expropriation and Compensation	90
	Overview of Content and Application of the Standard	90
	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	93
2.4.2.6	Free Transfer of Funds and Capital	94
	Overview of Content and Application of the Standard	95
	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	97
2.4.2.7	Umbrella Clauses in International Investment Treaties	97
2.4.2.8	Interim Conclusion	98

2.4.2.9	Competing Obligations Under Human Rights Law	99
	International Human Rights Obligations	101
	Domestic Human Rights Obligations	104
2.4.3	Investor-State Arbitration Offers in International Investment Treaties	106
2.4.3.1	Forms of State Consent to Investor-State Arbitration	107
	Consent Through Dispute Settlement Clauses in International Investment Treaties	107
	Consent Through Dispute Settlement Clauses in Domestic Investment Laws	108
	Consent Through Arbitration Clauses in Investor-State Contracts	109
2.4.3.2	Significance of Investment Treaty-Based Investor-State Arbitration	109
2.4.3.3	Features of Dispute Settlement Clauses in International Investment Treaties	110
	Scope of Consent to Investment Treaty-Based Investor-State Arbitration	111
	(Pre-) Conditions of Investment Treaty-Based Investor-State Arbitration	112
2.4.3.4	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	114
	Wide Dispute Settlement Clauses in International Investment Treaties	115
	Narrow Dispute Settlement Clauses in International Investment Treaties	116
	(Pre-) Conditions for Investor-State Arbitration in International Investment Treaties	117
2.4.3.5	Interim Conclusion	120
2.4.4	Investor-State Arbitrations Based on International Investment Treaties of Mongolia	121
2.4.4.1	Alstom Power Italia v. Mongolia	121
2.4.4.2	Paushok v. Mongolia	121
2.4.4.3	China Heilongjiang v. Mongolia	123
2.4.4.4	Khan Resources v. Mongolia	129
2.5	International Conventions Supporting the Enforcement of International Investment Treaties	133
2.5.1	Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards (1958)	133
2.5.1.1	International Obligation to Enforce Foreign Arbitral Awards	134
2.5.1.2	Challenge and Review of Foreign Arbitral Awards by National Courts	135

2.5.2	Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes Between States and Nationals of Other States (1965)	136
2.5.2.1	International Obligation to Enforce Convention-Based Arbitral Awards	137
2.5.2.2	Challenge and Annulment of Convention-Based Arbitral Awards	137
2.6	Summary of the Main Results	138
3	Domestic Investment Law	143
3.1	Investment Protection Under Domestic Investment Laws	145
3.1.1	Significance of Legal Protection Under Domestic Investment Laws	146
3.1.2	Drawbacks of erga omnes Protection Under Domestic Investment Laws	147
3.2	The Mongolian Investment Law (MIL) (2013)	147
3.2.1	The Course of the Legislative Process	148
3.2.1.1	The Foreign Investment Law (1993)	148
	Scope of Application and Admission of Foreign Investments	149
	Legal Preferences and Incentives for Foreign Investors	150
	Substantive Law Provisions on Investment Protection	150
	Procedural Law Provisions on the Settlement of Investor-State Disputes	151
3.2.1.2	Amendments to the Foreign Investment Law (2002)	151
	Scope of Application and Admission of Foreign Investments	152
	Legal Preferences and Incentives for Investors . . .	152
	Provisions on Investment Protection and the Settlement of Investor-State Disputes	153
3.2.1.3	Law on Foreign Investments in Strategic Sectors (2012)	154
	Background of the Law	154
	Legal Content and Restricting Measures	156
3.2.1.4	Fundamental Revision of the Domestic Investment Law System (2013)	158
3.2.2	Scope of Application of the Mongolian Investment Law . .	159
3.2.3	The Admission of Foreign Investments in Mongolia	160
3.2.3.1	Private-Owned Foreign Investments	161
3.2.3.2	State-Owned Foreign Investments	162
	Definition of Foreign State-Owned Legal Entity . .	162
	Admission Requirements and Authorisation Procedure	162

3.2.4	Taxation Preferences and Incentives for Investments	163
3.2.4.1	Types of Taxation Incentives and Covered Tax Rates	164
3.2.4.2	Tax-Rate-Stabilisation Certificates	164
	Issuing Criteria and Validity Periods of Tax-Rate-Stabilisation Certificates	164
	Right to Demand a Tax-Rate-Stabilisation Certificate and Legal Effect	166
3.2.5	Other Legal Incentives for Investments	167
3.2.5.1	Land Use-Related Measures	167
3.2.5.2	Other Promotional Measures	168
3.2.6	Qualified-Majority Requirement for Future Legal Amendments	169
3.3	Standards of Investment Protection and Reflection in the Mongolian Investment Law	169
3.3.1	Substantive Law Protection Standards in Domestic Investment Laws	170
3.3.1.1	National Treatment	171
	Direct and Indirect Guarantees of Equal Treatment	171
	Evaluation of the Domestic Investment Law	172
3.3.1.2	Expropriation and Compensation	173
	Constitutional and Domestic Investment Law Guarantees on Expropriation	173
	Evaluation of the Domestic Investment Law	174
3.3.1.3	Free Transfer of Funds and Capital	175
	Transferable Funds and Transfer Restrictions	175
	Evaluation of the Domestic Investment Law	176
3.3.1.4	Fair and Equitable Treatment	176
3.3.2	Investor-State Arbitration Offers in Domestic Investment Laws	177
3.3.2.1	Significance of Investor-State Arbitration Based on Domestic Investment Laws	178
3.3.2.2	Scope of Consent to Investor-State Arbitration Based on Domestic Investment Laws	179
3.3.2.3	(Pre-) Conditions of Investor-State Arbitration Based on Domestic Investment Laws	179
3.3.2.4	Evaluation of the Domestic Investment Law	180
3.4	Summary of the Main Results	181
4	Investor-State Contracts	185
4.1	Investment Protection Under Investment Contracts with Host States	186
4.1.1	Definition of Investment Contracts	188
4.1.2	Investment Contracts as a Unique Source of Rights and Obligations	189

4.1.2.1	Parties Involved and Objects of Investment Contracts	190
4.1.2.2	Special Contractual Techniques of Investment Protection	190
4.1.2.3	Investment Contracts and Relation to International Law	191
4.1.2.4	Public Law Nature of Investment Contracts	192
4.1.3	Significance of Legal Protection Under Investment Contracts	193
4.1.3.1	Contractual Support of Investment Law Protection and Public Governance	194
4.1.3.2	The Role of Investment Contracts in Mongolia	194
4.1.4	The Public Law Character of Investment Contracts in Mongolia	195
4.2	The Statutory Framework for Investment Contracts in Mongolia	197
4.2.1	Government Entitlement and Right to Demand an Investment Contract	198
4.2.2	Minimum Contract Duration of Investment Contracts	198
4.2.3	Contents of Investment Contracts Pursuant to Article 20.4 MIL	199
4.2.4	Government Regulation on Investment Contracts (2014)	200
4.2.4.1	Scope of Application	200
4.2.4.2	Application for an Investment Contract and Grounds for Refusal	201
4.2.4.3	Negotiation and Conclusion of Investment Contracts	201
4.2.4.4	Contents of Investment Contracts Pursuant to the Government Regulation	202
4.2.4.5	Monitoring and Termination of Investment Contracts	203
4.2.5	General Remarks on the Statutory Framework for Investment Contracts	203
4.2.5.1	Investment-Threshold-Amount Requirement and Consequences	204
4.2.5.2	Changes of Circumstances and Adaption or Termination of Investment Contracts	205
	Implementation of Renegotiation Clauses	205
	Change of Circumstances Addressed by National Law	206
4.3	Standards of Investment Protection Provided by Investment Contracts	208
4.3.1	Contracting on Legal Stability	209
4.3.1.1	Origins of Legal Instability	209
4.3.1.2	Legal Stability and Fair-and-Equitable-Treatment Clauses in International Investment Treaties	211

4.3.1.3	Contractual Stabilisation Clauses	215
4.3.1.4	Parliamentary Authorisation to Contract on Investment Stabilisation	217
4.3.2	Contracting on the Applicable Law	219
4.3.2.1	The Combined Application of National Law and International Law	221
4.3.2.2	Party Freedom to Choose the Applicable Law . . .	224
4.3.2.3	Potential Choice-of-Law Restrictions Under National Law	226
	Special Local-Law Requirements for Public Law Contracts	226
	General Local-Law Requirements in Domestic Investment Laws	228
	Restrictions Under Arbitration Rules and Domestic Arbitration Laws	228
4.3.2.4	Applicable Law in the Absence of a Choice of Law	230
4.3.3	Contracting on Dispute Settlement by International Arbitration	232
4.3.3.1	Significance of Investment Contract-Based Investor-State Arbitration	232
4.3.3.2	The Legality of Arbitration Agreements Involving the State and Public Law Contracts . . .	234
	Incapacity of State Entities to Enter into Arbitration Agreements	235
	Non-Arbitrability of Public Law Contracts and Disputes Arising from the Contract	238
4.3.3.3	Forum Selection Clauses in Investment Contracts	240
4.4	Standards of Investment Protection and Implementation in Investment Contracts in Mongolia	241
4.4.1	Stabilisation Clauses in Investment Contracts	242
4.4.2	Applicable-Law Clauses in Investment Contracts	243
4.4.2.1	General Permissibility of Applicable-Law Agreements	245
4.4.2.2	Potential Choice-of-Law Restrictions Under National Law	246
	Article 7.2 of the MIL	247
	Article 20.4 of the MIL	248
4.4.2.3	Application of International Law in the Absence of Its Choice	249
4.4.3	Arbitration Clauses in Investment Contracts	249
4.4.3.1	Statutory Framework for Public-Private Arbitrations	250

4.4.3.2	Standing Offer to Arbitrate Investment Contracts in Article 6.9 of the MIL	252
4.4.3.3	Scope of Arbitration Agreements and Compatibility with National Law	252
	Claims in Relation to Investment Contracts	253
	Claims in Relation to Domestic Laws	254
	Claims in Relation to International Investment Treaties	256
4.4.4	Interim Conclusion	258
4.4.4.1	Contracting on Investment Stabilisation	258
4.4.4.2	Contracting on the Applicable Law	259
4.4.4.3	Contracting on Dispute Settlement by International Arbitration	260
4.5	Investment Contracts Invoked Under Umbrella Clauses in International Investment Treaties	261
4.5.1	Umbrella Clauses and Contractual Undertakings by the Host State	262
4.5.1.1	Overview of Principle and Rationale	263
4.5.1.2	Legal Debates and Interpretive Uncertainty	263
4.5.2	Umbrella Clauses and Unilateral Promises or <i>erga omnes</i> Guarantees by the Host State	270
4.5.3	Umbrella Clauses and Relation to Forum Selection Clauses in Investment Contracts	274
4.5.4	Evaluation of International Investment Treaties	279
4.5.4.1	Classic Umbrella Clauses	281
4.5.4.2	Umbrella Clauses with Particularities	282
	Restriction to Contractual Undertakings	282
	Exclusion of <i>erga omnes</i> Guarantees	282
	The ‘Singaporean Type’ of Umbrella Clause	283
4.5.5	Investment Contracts and International Investment Treaties in the Absence of an Umbrella Clause	285
4.5.5.1	The Extension of Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment to Umbrella Clauses	286
4.5.5.2	Investment Contracts Invoked Under Wide Dispute Settlement Clauses in International Investment Treaties	289
4.6	Summary of the Main Results	294
5	Results and Concluding Remarks	303
Annex	309
Table of Cases	325
Table of Treaties	335
Bibliography	343

The Protection of Foreign Investments in Mongolia
Treaties, Domestic Law, and Contracts on Investments
in International Comparison and Arbitral Practice

Scharaw, B.

2018, XX, 358 p., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-3-319-66088-2